HOW PLACE INFLUENCES EMPLOYMENT OUTCOMES FOR ETHNIC MINORITIES

Mumtaz Lalani, Hilary Metcalf, Leila Tufekci, Andrew Corley, Heather Rolfe and Anitha George

This report explores how place influences employment outcomes for people from ethnic minority groups and discusses policy implications.

Through case studies of Glasgow, Leicester and Luton, the study explores how the educational and employment experiences of African Caribbeans, Indians and Pakistanis are influenced by local factors. It identifies policy measures to address the continuing labour market disadvantage of people from ethnic minority groups.

The report uses individual educational and employment histories and information on local provision to examine:

- how the provision and delivery of schooling, other education, training and careers support affect ethnic groups differently;
- how local employment structures lead to different outcomes by ethnic group;
- the role of culture, racism and class in affecting employment outcomes;
- the role of familial, community and state support in affecting employment outcomes; and
- policy implications for community, local and national stakeholders.

INSPIRING
SOCIAL
CHANGE

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The aim of the study was to explore how place might influence employment outcomes for people from ethnic minority groups and, in particular, why they might suffer disproportionate disadvantage in areas of higher deprivation.

The study was based on case studies in three areas (Leicester and, depending on the group, Glasgow or Luton) and three ethnic groups (African Caribbean, Indian and Pakistani). As far as possible, the Indian group was focussed on East African Asians. The findings are based on qualitative data on individuals' education and employment histories and information gathered about the local areas from stakeholders and from published data.

Analysis of the employment outcomes for the three ethnic groups in these areas showed that there were not only differences in employment patterns between the groups, but for each group there were differences between Luton and Leicester. Despite overall unemployment being similar in Leicester and Luton, African Caribbeans and Indians in Luton were less likely to be unemployed than those in Leicester. The opposite was true for the Pakistani group, which had better employment outcomes in Leicester than in Luton.

Many of the themes identified in this study, in particular the difficulties faced by young people from disadvantaged backgrounds or in deprived areas, are relevant across the UK and to members of all ethnic groups, including the white majority. The intergenerational transmission of poor labour market performance and poverty is pervasive: people from ethnic minority groups are caught up in it to a greater degree due to racism and discrimination. It seems to us important that generic social mobility policies are improved, but that they are developed with better understanding of the role of ethnicity and are monitored to ensure that all ethnic minority groups are fully supported. This does not mean neither place nor ethnicity matters; as the study shows, context matters for how these difficulties manifest themselves for individuals and communities, and they are exacerbated by social segregation and lack of knowledge. This emphasises the need both for targeted interventions and for mainstream services to become more effective, in part by addressing the specific needs of local communities.

Education and training prior to entering the labour market

A number of key issues arose from the research regarding how well schooling and continued education provided the foundation for decent employment. Parental background is a vital aspect at this age and, to a large extent, those with greater social capital were better able to ensure a better educational foundation. However, racism, cultural factors, parental knowledge and migration also played their part.

Racism and the impact of teachers' low expectations caused problems. This highlights the importance of continued policies to tackle racism.

The quality of education received is affected by parental understanding of and interaction with the school system, which can be restricted. This applies most strongly for migrants.

The quality of formal careers information, advice and guidance is widely criticised. This makes informal support particularly important. However, the employment experience of informal advisers is key, which, given the concentration of people from minority ethnic groups in lower-level occupations, can be problematic.

Employment

Cultural differences in relation to women's family caring role resulted in Pakistani women and, to a somewhat lesser degree, Indian women being much more likely than African Caribbean women to be economically inactive. There was also evidence of culture restricting job choice and encouraging entry to lower-paid occupations for Pakistani women. This raises major issues for action on poverty, when state policies largely encourage paid employment for all adults.

Access to formal advice and guidance was lacking. Greater and more effective provision would be useful. This is particularly important for some ethnic groups with lower achievement in the labour market, who have less access to informal sources of information, due to more restricted labour market experience.

Volunteering can enhance employability and raise aspirations, enabling movement to better paid jobs from unemployment or low paid jobs. Some people from ethnic minority groups (particularly Pakistanis and, to a lesser degree, Indians) report low participation in voluntary work. The difference may, in part, be due to social support activities related to religion not being regarded as voluntary work by the volunteers. In this case, the activity is less likely to be used in job applications and so does not provide labour market advantage.

Adult education and training

There was substantial involvement in adult education and training amongst the individuals participating in the study. In part, this was to address previous underachievement in earlier schooling, and related career change. The effectiveness of the various types of training varied, with courses for qualifications appearing most useful for employment progression.

Guidance and advice, other than where forthcoming from one's employer or colleagues, seemed, in the main, to be rudimentary and reliant on course providers.

The role of place

What are the implications of the above for the role of place in ethnic minority poverty? Obviously, the quality of education and of careers support vary across areas and so the outcomes for ethnic minorities (as well as for the ethnic majority) will vary. However, for people from ethnic minority groups, particularly migrants, there was evidence that knowledge of and interaction with the education system and knowledge of career options may be particularly limited, thus reducing the effectiveness of the system for ethnic minority children.

The extent to which education policies (by local authorities, schools and others) support people from all ethnic groups and migrants and non-migrants to benefit equally from education and careers support will vary, and so differences in outcomes by ethnicity and migrant history will result. Moreover, people from ethnic minority groups' knowledge may also vary by locality. The evidence suggested that knowledge was likely to be least amongst migrants, but that it was also likely to be more limited the greater the degree of social segregation. It also suggested that self-employment might contribute to social segregation and limitations on knowledge.

Segregation

The research identified segregation as a factor contributing to employment performance, limiting the effectiveness of social networks and reinforcing cultural norms of women's role as nurturer rather than as breadwinner for some of the ethnic groups. The extent to which this contributed to the employment patterns described above is unclear, in part because the published data on residential segregation groups all Asians together and so residential segregation for Indians and Pakistanis cannot be identified. It would be useful to examine segregation and employment performance for each Asian group separately using the 2011 Census to explore these issues more robustly.

However, the qualitative research suggested that segregation was greater for migrants, particularly for Pakistanis and, to a lesser extent, East African Asians. Respondents described their migrant parents as being socially segregated both by culture and by self-employment, reducing parents' ability to support their children's education and career development. Self-employment appeared to exacerbate social segregation, especially where labour was limited to family.

The ethnic composition of the local population

The influence of London on labour market performance for people from ethnic minority groups in Luton was identified as important, with London offering a less 'racialised' labour market environment and workplaces. Whilst it is understandable that employment in London may be less 'racialised' than in many places, it is less clear why this should not also be the case for Luton, since 45 per cent of the population in Luton are from black and minority ethnic groups. In the study, the issue was reported by African Caribbeans in Luton only. It may be that this issue is more common for some groups (or for some groups in some areas) only. If so, it may also mean that the relative size of ethnic groups is also important; African Caribbeans comprise only four per cent of the population in Luton.

The research identified segregation as a factor contributing to employment performance, limiting the effectiveness of social networks and reinforcing cultural norms of women's role as nurturer rather than as breadwinner for some of the ethnic groups.

Migration

Finally, for any ethnic group, differences in labour market performance by place may be partly due to the extent to which migration is continuing, renewing the numbers unfamiliar with the labour market.

Policy implications

The research highlighted issues which are of long-standing concern and examined how these might be affected by place. To a large extent, racism and class underlie the issues identified. Developing policy suggestions to tackle these is beyond this study. Instead, some approaches for more discrete policies are suggested.

Working with people from ethnic minority groups

A strong message from the research was that policies and provision need to be developed by people from ethnic minority groups or with their involvement; otherwise, differences between ethnic groups and the impact of policies by ethnicity are liable to be ignored. Involvement may be through joint working or consultation with community groups, employees and others. The need applies to all parts of the public sector (local authorities, educational institutions, the Department for Work and Pensions (DWP)/ Jobcentre Plus, Local Enterprise Partnerships) and to employers. Special mention should be made in relation to schools and working with parents, ensuring parents' equal participation across ethnic groups.

Local authorities

The research suggested small ethnic minority groups were being overlooked by some local authorities. A related issue is the patchiness of local authorities' monitoring of service recipients by ethnicity. It is important that local authorities have good knowledge of each of the ethnic minority groups in their authority and whether there are differences in needs for improving labour market outcomes. The 2011 Census provides basic quantitative data. This needs to be supplemented with knowledge of culture, experiences and needs to identify where local authority policies are failing to assist specific ethnic groups and to identify how provision might be improved.

Improving knowledge of the labour market and educational systems

The report has identified variation in knowledge of the educational and labour market systems. This is related to class as much as ethnicity, although it is most severe for migrants. Lack of knowledge reduces employment performance and reinforces social immobility.

Schools, local authorities, careers service providers, the DWP (and its subcontractors) and other providers of employment and educational support need to recognise, take responsibility for and reduce variations in knowledge that affect the service received. Whether or not approaches are targeted at or tailored towards specific groups by ethnicity, it will be important to monitor by ethnicity how well key groups are served, particularly if the approach is not targeted.

Employers play a key role in providing careers guidance and directed training for some employees. Their support can be highly targeted to career development and tailored for the individual. Their involvement in mentoring schemes and in wider information schemes would be particularly useful.

1 INTRODUCTION

Poverty amongst people from minority ethnic groups is high. Up to 50 per cent more Indian, Chinese, African Caribbean and Black African people were estimated to be in poverty compared with white British people and around three times as many Pakistanis and Bangladeshis (Nandi and Platt, 2010).[1] In total, 46 per cent of Pakistanis and 50 per cent of Bangladeshis were estimated to be in poverty. The pattern of poverty varies across groups, for example, inequality is high amongst Indians (and varies with religion) and low amongst African Caribbean people (and varies by gender) (Platt, 2011).

Ethnic differences in labour market performance are a major contributor to the variation in poverty rates by ethnicity. All the major ethnic minority groups have lower economic activity rates and higher rates of unemployment than the ethnic majority (Metcalf, 2009). Economic activity and employment rates for Pakistani and Bangladeshi women are particularly low, reducing average household income (Census, 2011). People from ethnic minority groups in aggregate are concentrated in low-skilled jobs and are under-represented in higher-skilled occupations, especially in managerial occupations. Pay rates are lower for most of the major ethnic minority groups (the exceptions being Indian and Chinese) (Longhi and Platt, 2008). The pay differential means that being in work does not reduce the poverty gap between people from ethnic minority groups and white British (Kenway and Palmer, 2007). Indeed, for Bangladeshis, the poverty gap is larger for those in work than those out of work. (The larger poverty gap once in work seems likely to be due to a combination of the low earnings in work combined with larger average family size increasing out-of-work benefits. In-work benefits should compensate to some extent and it would be interesting to investigate whether eligibility criteria or claiming rates disproportionately disadvantaged this group.)

A wide range of factors has been identified as contributing to ethnic differences in labour market performance: discrimination, cultural preferences (affecting economic activity rates for women; job choice, including preferences for self-employment; family versus individual influences on job choice), education, job search and use of networks (Battu, *et al.*, 2011; Shaw, 2000). Migration also plays a role, affecting English language competence, knowledge of the labour market and job search processes, networks and recognition of qualifications (Platt, 2006).

Some researchers have raised the issue of location. In its simplest form, location may affect labour market performance of ethnic minority groups because they are concentrated in locations with relatively poor employment opportunities. Clark and Drinkwater (2007) shifted the focus from concentration to deprivation. They found that in highly deprived areas, people from minority ethnic groups were disproportionately less likely (than nationally) to be in employment compared with white British people. The reasons for this are unclear and it suggests that the influence of location may be complex. The disproportionately poor labour market performance of people from minority ethnic groups in areas of high deprivation is particularly important, given that ethnic minority groups are concentrated in the most deprived areas of the country: people from 'non-white' ethnic minority groups were twice as likely as 'whites' to be living in the poorest 10 per cent of neighbourhoods[2] (ODPM, 2006).

As part of the development of its programme of research into ethnicity and poverty, the JRF commissioned a scoping review of ethnicity, poverty and place. The review argued that consideration of place is important as it enables analysis to move beyond considering vulnerability to poverty as something necessarily arising from ethnicity or culture alone (Garner and Bhattacharyya, 2011). It set out that a focus on 'place' offers a means of assessing the resources available to (and barriers acting against) people in different ethnic groups in particular areas, and thus of the factors which impact on the circumstances in which people live and the choices open to them. The places in which people live and work have a significant effect on their lives, in particular through the influences location has on access to labour markets, services and social networks.

In the rest of this chapter, first, the study aims, scope and methods are described. Drawing on previous research, the factors which may result in differences in labour market outcomes by ethnic group between locations are then discussed. The chapter concludes with a description of the structure of the report.

Aims and scope of the study

The aim of the study was to add to our understanding of how place might influence employment outcomes and, in particular, why people from ethnic minority groups might suffer disproportionate disadvantage in areas of higher deprivation. We wanted to understand whether 'place' affected employment success and how this interacted with ethnicity.

Our framework for considering place was that each individual faces a range of locationally specific factors which influence their labour market outcome (e.g. local education provision, employment opportunities, informal support networks, transport).[3] These factors tend to be examined separately (as though their effects on outcomes are additive), but they may interact to affect labour market outcomes disproportionately. Moreover, some of the factors will be determined, to some extent, at the local level (e.g. by the

local authority, by a community group). The purpose of the research was to examine how factors might interact, resulting in differences in labour market outcomes by locality (i.e. place) and how this might vary by ethnic group: to identify how individual histories (covering migration, education and labour market) were affected by local factors including educational provision, the local employment context and formal and informal support services. Whilst the research was conducted in three local authority areas, the local authority area was not assumed to define the geography of place: for each individual the relevant geography could vary (just as an individual's labour market may be restricted to their neighbourhood, the city or to other cities). What was important was to identify how the bundle of factors might affect outcomes. The focus was on labour market outcomes for the ethnic groups under study, not outcomes (or influences) relative to other ethnic groups.

Whilst the study was most interested in improving outcomes for those who do worst in the labour market, the study examined both those who had done well in the labour market as well as those who had not. Both help understanding of how outcomes might be improved.

To identify place-specific influences, the research needed to take into account a wide range of factors well known to affect employment outcomes. It therefore explored factors such as education, training and culture.

Method

The study focussed on three ethnic groups (African Caribbean, Indian and Pakistani) in three case study areas (Glasgow, Leicester and Luton). Each ethnic group was studied in two case study areas only: all three groups in Leicester; African Caribbeans and Indians in Luton; and Pakistanis in Glasgow. As far as possible, the Indian group was focussed on East African Asians. This was feasible for the qualitative research, but, owing to data limitations, quantitative data relates to the Indian group more broadly.

The ethnic groups were selected for a number for reasons. All three have been established in the UK for a long period: we wanted to explore, as far as possible, factors which were connected with ethnicity and race, rather than with migration. However, as the report makes clear, migration effects appear to persist, affecting not only migrants' labour market performance but also that of second and, perhaps subsequent, generations. The three selected groups provide contrasting experience and characteristics. African Caribbean men have relatively poor and African Caribbean women relatively good labour market performance on average. Pakistanis tend to have poor labour market performance and very high levels of deprivation. In addition, Pakistani women have very low rates of economic activity. In comparison, the Indian group overall has experienced economic success. The three groups also reflect differing cultures and, to the extent that the Indians were East African Asians, different historical migration experiences (with East African Asians largely forced migrants, in effect, refugees, and the other two groups migrating for economic reasons).

The case studies were conducted within local authority areas, in order to reduce the variation in policy influences.[4] The main criterion for the selection of case study areas was the size of the ethnic groups of interest. As well as requiring an adequate size of each group to facilitate qualitative research, we also wanted groups to be of differing importance, by population size, as we wanted to investigate whether this might have an effect on economic performance. The hypothesis was that, compared with small ethnic minority groups, large ethnic minority groups might be better served by local provision.

In addition, JRF wanted the research to take place in at least two countries within the UK. A consequence of the selection criteria was that the study focusses on conurbations with relatively high ethnic minority populations.

In each case study area, in-depth interviews were held with local stakeholders and other key informants (listed in Table 1 and Table 2) in order to seek detailed information on the employment patterns of the selected ethnic groups and factors which might affect these. This included spatial issues (of residence, employment and transport), aspirations, cultural preferences and practices, education, local employment and educational provision, and formal and informal support services. This was complemented by the collection of documentary evidence on the case study area and data analysis.

Table 1: Stakeholder interviews

Case study area	Organisations
Glasgow	West of Scotland Regional Equality Council, Glasgow City Council, Roshni, Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights
Leicester	Race Equality Centre, Leicestershire Chamber of Commerce, Leicester City Council (multiple departments), African Caribbean Citizens Forum, Highfields Centre
Luton	Luton Borough Council (multiple departments), Labour Party, Luton Rights, Luton Law Centre, African Caribbean Community Development Forum

Table 2: Key informant interviews

Case study area	Organisations
Glasgow	Amina (The Muslim Women's Resource Centre), Pollokshields Development Agency
Leicester	Leicester Asian Business Association, Pakistan Youth and Community Association
Luton	Luton Trade Union Congress

Interviews were conducted with individuals from the selected ethnic minority groups to gather education and employment histories, including information on aspirations, support and knowledge of the labour market. Forty-nine individuals were interviewed in total. The sample comprised individuals aged 18 to 65, and included both migrants and non-migrants. Further details of the individuals interviewed are given in Table 3 and Table 4.

Table 3: Individuals interviewed by gender

		Glasgow	Leicester	Luton
African Caribbean	all		7	8
	women		5	6
	men		2	2
East African Asian	all		14	6
	women		6	3
	men		8	3
Pakistani	all	10	4	
	women	5	1	
	men	5	3	
Total	all	10	25	14
	women	5	12	9
	men	5	13	5

Table 4: Individuals interviewed by place of birth

		Glasgow	Leicester	Luton
African Caribbean	migrant		1	4
	non-migrant		6	4
East African Asian	migrant		8	6
	non-migrant		6	0
Pakistani	migrant	5	2	
	non-migrant	5	2	
Total	migrant	5	11	10
	non-migrant	5	14	4

Finally, employers and recruitment agencies (four per locality) were interviewed to explore factors affecting performance and whether there appeared to be any differences in treatment by ethnic group. The employers were in the health sector, IT, retail and manufacturing.

Labour market outcomes, deprivation and place

Previous research into labour market performance by ethnicity, and into locational factors in particular, has identified a number of factors which may result in differences in labour market outcomes for ethnic minority groups between locations. Here we present a number of hypotheses.

Settlement patterns

Ethnic minority groups are highly geographically clustered across the UK, particularly into cities, based on historical migration patterns. These often reflect economic factors at the time of settlement (for example, labour demand in particular industries). Groups which settled in areas which experienced subsequent economic decline would be expected to perform worse than others. There is some evidence of initial settlement patterns being altered by subsequent internal migration (including in response to economic changes), but there is also evidence of lack of mobility, which inhibits economic success for those in declining areas. Berthoud (2000) argued that employment demand in the inner cities where people from minority ethnic groups are concentrated had affected their labour market performance: they were now concentrated in areas of high unemployment; the industries in which they were concentrated experienced greater fluctuations in demand; and these areas had seen a move to skilled work and to semi-skilled jobs in the service sector, for which those formerly employed in manufacturing were less suited.

Moreover, as described above, people from minority ethnic groups are disproportionately concentrated in areas of high deprivation. This may hamper access to jobs, through reducing informal recruitment channels (networking with people in employment) and limiting self-employment opportunities (Battu, *et al.*, 2011). In addition, it may lead to labour market discouragement, reducing educational achievement and aspirations.

Cultural factors

On average, important cultural differences exist between ethnic groups. These affect aspirations, for example, the value placed on individual versus group (e.g. familial, extended kinship) success and how success is defined (money, property, honour, etc.) (Shaw, 2000). Linked to this is the value placed on education, on employment and different types of employment and

on the economic role of women. Culture also affects the establishment and use of networks (see section below). However, culture is not immutable and it evolves. This evolution may be affected by location: the mix of ethnicities in an area, the degree of segregation and state and community policies and provision. Cultural differences may also be misidentified, through inadequate identification of the ethnic groups in a locality and linked cultural factors (e.g. religion, migration history and social class).

Capital: educational, economic and social

These directly affect labour market success. Outcomes will be affected both by historical and cultural factors specific to ethnic groups, and by area factors: the quality of local schools, how the education system adapts to different ethnic groups, and how the broader social capital of an area evolves in response to population change.

In education, the interplay of knowledge and discrimination may reduce success: people from ethnic minority groups tend to be better qualified than whites, but the qualifications may carry less currency (e.g. ethnic minorities' degrees are disproportionately from new universities; see Modood and Shiner, 1994); successfully interacting with the school and teachers affects children's educational success. Social capital is influenced by ethnic origin: groups with agricultural backgrounds (e.g. Pakistanis) tend to do worse than those with mercantile and professional backgrounds (e.g. East African Asians). This has parallels with, and interacts with, the lack of social mobility by class in the UK.

Networks play an important role in labour market success. These may be, but are not always, geographically based. Such networks can provide access to capital, as well as information and business contacts, but Battu, *et al.* (2011) found that networks were less effective for job search for some ethnic groups, notably Pakistani and Bangladeshi. The authors postulated that part of the reason for this was differences in the quality of networks by ethnicity and that the degree of network segregation might play a part.

Formal service support structures

Differences in educational and employment knowledge, networks, access to capital, etc., may be mediated by formal service support structures. These include national structures, but their delivery is likely to vary locally. Thus, differences in access to education and jobs may be ameliorated where there is a focus on addressing disadvantage and compensating for disparities in educational, economic and social capital. They may also help to address racism and discrimination.

Report structure

The next chapter describes the three case study areas. As well as describing their populations by ethnicity and giving information on the industrial and skill structure, the labour market activity of the three ethnic groups is described for Leicester and Luton. (Data for Glasgow was unavailable at the time the research was conducted, in early 2013.)

This is followed by four chapters on findings. The first considers educational experience and the preparation young people had for making career choices. The second turns to employment experiences, examining the pattern of employment and factors, including knowledge of the labour market, which affected this. Adult education and training, which featured

extensively in employment histories and were important means to better employment, are discussed next. The final findings chapter looks at volunteering as a means of employment enhancement. The final chapter draws conclusions and policy implications.

2 THE CASE STUDY AREAS

This chapter describes the case study areas in which the study took place. First, the ethnic composition of the populations of each case study area is described, along with information on levels of deprivation. Next, a brief description of the labour market is given. The final section examines differences in the employment patterns between Leicester and Luton for the three ethnic groups[5] involved in this study.

Ethnic and deprivation profiles of the case study areas

The influence of location on the labour market performance of people from ethnic minority groups may differ with the ethnic minority profile of an area. Garner and Bhattacharyya (2011) suggest that for locations with high ethnic minority populations, those with a single main minority group have the highest levels of concentrated and extreme poverty.[6]

Over 50 per cent of the populations of Leicester and in Luton are from ethnic minority groups, amongst the local authorities with the highest percentages in the UK (see Table 5). Glasgow's ethnic minority population, at 9 per cent, is relatively large for Scotland, but not for the UK. The ethnic minority profiles differ substantially between the areas, including for the three minority groups studied. The population, deprivation and residential segregation profiles of the case study areas are described below.

Almost 10 per cent of the Glasgow population are people from ethnic minority groups, with 5.5 per cent non-white or mixed (see Table 5). Pakistanis, the ethnic group studied in Glasgow, are the largest ethnic minority group, comprising 2.7 per cent of the population. With the exception of Irish and other white (2 per cent each), other ethnic minority groups are a quarter this size or less. More recent estimates suggest little change in this pattern by 2010, although the percentage of Pakistanis (and people from ethnic minority groups as a whole) was estimated to have increased, to 3.5 per cent and 12.8 per cent, respectively (Glasgow City Council, 2012b).

Table 5: Population by ethnicity, case study areas, 2011 (percentage of population)

	2001		2011		
	Glasgow	**Scotland**	**Leicester**	**Luton**	**England and Wales**
White British	90.8	95.5	45.1	44.6	80.5
People from ethnic minority groups	9.2	4.5	54.9	55.4	19.5
Other white (Irish and other)	3.8	2.5	5.5	10.1	5.4
Non-white and mixed	5.5	2.0	49.4	45.3	14.1
Indian[a]	*0.7*	*0.3*	*28.3*	*5.2*	*2.6*
African Caribbean[b]	*0.05*	*0.04*	*1.5*	*4.0*	*1.1*
Pakistani	*2.7*	*0.6*	*2.4*	*14.4*	*2.0*
Asian, other	*0.7*	*0.3*	*4.0*	*2.9*	*1.5*
Total	100	100	100	100	100

Figures may not sum due to rounding.

Case study areas are the local authority area.

[a] East African Asians are not identifiable in the Census. For England and Wales, the data are for 'Asian/Asian British; Other Asian'; for Scotland the data are for 'Indian'.

[b] Figures relate to 'African Caribbean'. 'White and Black Caribbean' (i.e. mixed) are excluded. The latter comprise 1.4 per cent in Leicester and 1.9 per cent in Luton. Figures are not available for Glasgow.

Sources: Leicester, Luton and England and Wales: ONS, 2011 Census; Glasgow and Scotland: *Scotland's Census, 2001*. Data from the Scottish 2011 census was not available at the time of the study.

According to stakeholders, Pakistani migration to Glasgow had occurred mainly in the 1960s and 1970s, but it has continued since then, largely for marriage and family reasons. Early Pakistani migrants were mostly farmers and labourers. They worked as street traders, then on the buses. Some had moved into self-employment.

Leicester and Luton have amongst the highest ethnic minority populations in the UK (55 per cent each). Leicester's was third highest and Luton's fourth highest in England and Wales in 2001 (Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, 2006).

In Leicester, the largest ethnic minority group is Indian, at 28.3 per cent of the population. All other groups are much smaller: in order of size, other white (including Irish) 6 per cent, other Asian and Black African (4 per cent each), followed by the other two groups studied, Pakistani and African Caribbean (2 per cent each).

Leicester's Indian community arrived in two main ways (Leicester City Council, 2010). First, Indians started arriving in the 1950s (and have continued to arrive), mainly from Gujarat. A second group arrived in the 1970s: Indians who were expelled from Uganda and Kenya. The numbers now living in Leicester who came from (or whose parents or grandparents came from) East Africa is unclear, but, according to stakeholders, they form a sizeable percentage. Pakistanis also started migrating to Leicester in the 1950s and some migration has continued (Leicester City Council, 2010). African Caribbeans mainly migrated to Leicester in the 1950s, although a small amount of migration continues. In particular, there was an influx from Montserrat after the 1995 volcanic eruption.

In Luton, no single group dominates the ethnic minority mix. Pakistanis formed the largest ethnic minority group in 2011, comprising 14.4 per cent of the population. African Caribbeans were the fifth largest, at 4 per cent, below white other (10 per cent), Bangladeshis (7 per cent) and Indians and Black Africans (5 per cent each).

According to stakeholders, African Caribbeans moved to Luton in response to post-war labour shortages in the town (linked to the Vauxhall car factory). They were part of the Windrush generation of migrants (i.e. migrants from the Caribbean in the late 1940s and early 1950s) and first settled elsewhere in Britain. In addition, there was direct recruitment from the West Indies. African Caribbeans have continued to move to Luton, largely from other parts of Britain. East African Asians reportedly included many professionals who commuted to London. Stakeholders in Leicester did not comment on the pattern of Pakistani migration.

Deprivation

Deprivation in all three areas is high. In 2012, in Leicester, almost 50 per cent more children were living in poverty than nationally (29 per cent and 20 per cent, respectively) and in Luton about one-third more children were living in poverty than nationally (27 per cent and 20 per cent, respectively) (see Table 17; from the Campaign to End Child Poverty, 2013). Glasgow City has the highest concentration of deprived localities in Scotland (Scottish Government, 2012). Twenty-two per cent of the Glasgow population are living in income deprivation.

Ethnic minority patterns of deprivation in Luton are similar to national patterns, with non-whites more likely to live in the most deprived neighbourhoods: 35 per cent of the population in the 10 per cent of most deprived neighbourhoods were Asian and 11 per cent black, compared with 18 per cent and 6 per cent respectively elsewhere (ODPM, 2006). However, the ethnic patterns of deprivation in Leicester and Glasgow are unusual. Leicester is one of the few[7] cities in England and Wales in which people from ethnic minority groups are not over-represented in the poorest neighbourhoods (ODPM, 2006). This difference was due to Asian, but not black, people, being more likely to live outside the poorest neighbourhoods.[8] Leicester City Council (2008) suggests that it is Indians alone whose pattern of residence bucks the national pattern and that Pakistanis are concentrated in areas of high deprivation in the city. Glasgow, too, has a lower percentage of people from ethnic minority groups living in the most deprived areas than in the rest of the city and this applies to Pakistanis, as well as to most other ethnic minority groups (Glasgow City Council, 2012).

The ethnic patterns of deprivation in Leicester and Glasgow are unusual.

Segregation

Segregation may also influence labour market performance, affecting access to information (Battu, *et al.*, 2011) and employment opportunities.

Residential segregation was rated as moderately high in both Luton and Leicester, but higher (close to being categorised as high) in the latter (ODPM, 2006; Leicester City Council, 2008). In both cities, residential segregation was higher between whites and Asians than between whites and blacks (Leicester City Council, 2008). Indeed, in Luton, most Asians lived in one area of the city (Mayhew and Waples, 2011), but, according to stakeholders, African Caribbeans are spread across the city.

The labour markets

The following briefly describes the labour markets of the case study areas: their buoyancy, key industries, occupational structure and skill levels.

Glasgow City

Glasgow City has a history of employment in heavy engineering, combined with being a major centre of public sector employment. It is now characterised by high service employment and little manufacturing, with a population polarised to high and low qualification levels. It has very high levels of child poverty.

Glasgow has higher unemployment than in Britain overall (11 per cent and 8 per cent, respectively) and earnings for men are 8 per cent below the British average (see Table 6 and Table 7). For women, earnings are slightly below the national average. The economic activity rate is low, 71 per cent compared with 77 per cent for Britain. It is low for both women and men. Almost twice as many children are living in poverty than nationally: 35 per cent and 20 per cent, respectively (see Table 17).

Table 6: Economic activity by gender, Oct. 2011–Sept. 2012, Glasgow

		Glasgow	Britain
All people	Economically active[a]	71	77
	In employment[a]	62	71
	Unemployed[b]	11	8
Males	Economically active[a]	75	83
	In employment[a]	66	76
	Unemployed[b]	12	8
Females	Economically active[a]	66	71
	In employment[a]	59	65
	Unemployed[b]	11	7

[a] % of those aged 16–64.
[b] % of those economically active aged 16 and over.
Source: Annual population survey.

Table 7: Median gross weekly earnings, full-time workers, 2012, Glasgow

	Glasgow	Britain
All people	£474.9	£508.0
Males	£507.4	£548.8
Females	£432.7	£449.6

Source: Annual survey of hours and earnings.

In terms of qualifications, the population is relatively polarised. Compared with Britain, a higher percentage have NVQ Level 4 and higher qualifications (40 per cent, compared with 33 per cent nationally), but more have no qualifications (17 per cent and 11 per cent, respectively) (see Table 8). At the same time, occupational levels are similar to national averages (see Table 16). This suggests there may be relatively higher competition for jobs at both the highest and lowest ends.

Services are more important than nationally (90 per cent and 84 per cent of jobs, respectively), with finance, IT and other business activities, and public administration, education and health, employing more people (see Table 15). Manufacturing employment is less important.

Table 8: Qualifications, Oct. 2011–Sept. 2012, Glasgow*

	Glasgow	Britain
NVQ4 and above	40	33
NVQ3 and above	56	53
NVQ2 and above	68	70
NVQ1 and above	76	83
Other qualifications	7	7
No qualifications	17	11

* % of population aged 16–64.
Source: Annual population survey.

Leicester City

Historically, employment in Leicester was dominated by manufacturing and particularly the hosiery trade. The latter provided substantial employment for women as well as men. Leicester City Council area is now characterised by high unemployment, low-skilled jobs and low pay.

The employment rate is low (72 per cent compared with 77 per cent for Britain) due to a low economic activity rate and high unemployment rate (see Table 9).

Table 9: Economic activity by gender, Oct. 2011–Sept. 2012, Leicester

		Leicester	Britain
All people	Economically active[a]	72	77
	In employment[a]	61	71
	Unemployed[b]	14	8
Males	Economically active[a]	78	83
	In employment[a]	58	76
	Unemployed[b]	14	8
Females	Economically active[a]	66	71
	In employment[a]	56	65
	Unemployed[b]	16	7

[a] % of those aged 16–64.
[b] % of those economically active aged 16 and over.
Source: Annual population survey.

Manufacturing and the public sector are more important for employment than nationally, but still only account for 14 per cent and 26 per cent of jobs respectively, compared with 10 per cent and 22 per cent nationally (see Table 15).

Employment is concentrated in low-paid, low-skilled jobs. Twenty-nine per cent of jobs are in the lowest-level occupations (process, plant and machine operatives and elementary occupations), compared with 17 per cent nationally (see Table 16). Only 33 per cent are in the highest levels (managerial, professional and associate professional), compared with 44 per cent nationally.

With these occupational patterns, it is unsurprising that earnings are low: median earnings were only 79 per cent of those for Britain in 2012 (see Table 10). The resident population is less qualified than nationally and this applies throughout qualification levels: 16 per cent have no qualifications and 27 per cent have NVQ4 and above, compared with eleven per cent and 33 per cent respectively in Britain (see Table 11).

Table 10: Median gross weekly earnings, full-time workers, 2012, Leicester

	Leicester	Britain
All people	£402.4	£508.0
Males	£415.7	£548.8
Females	£375.3	£449.6

Source: Annual survey of hours and earnings.

According to Leicester City Council, 'educational attainment rates are among the lowest in the country' (Leicester City Council, 2008). There were marked differences by ethnicity in attainment. In terms of gaining five or more GCSEs at A* to C in 2005, 52 per cent of Asians (of whom most were Indian) did, compared with 43 per cent for Luton as a whole (Leicester City Council, 2008). 'Blacks' achieved the least, at 33 per cent. Leicester has disproportionately high levels of people with low literacy: approximately two-thirds of residents cannot read or write English easily: 68% have skills below Level 2 compared with the national average of 56% (Leicester City Council, 2011).

Table 11: Qualifications, Oct. 2011–Sept. 2012, Leicester*

	Leicester	Britain
NVQ4 and above	27	33
NVQ3 and above	45	53
NVQ2 and above	61	70
NVQ1 and above	74	83
Other qualifications	9	7
No qualifications	16	11

* % of population aged 16–64.
Source: Annual population survey.

Forty-six per cent of children in Leicester City Council schools speak another language at home (Leicester City Council, 2011).

Luton Borough

Luton in the 1950s and 60s was dominated by employment in the car industry, and particularly by one company, Vauxhall Motors. Over this period, the labour market was very buoyant, resulting in labour shortages and high wages. Employment in the town declined as production at the Vauxhall Motors plant decreased, and it finally closed. The airport and associated industries are now the main driver of employment in the town.

Luton is characterised by a poor labour market for women, with low economic activity and high unemployment rates. Overall, skill levels are relatively low, and manufacturing, together with transport and communications, are relatively important. Employment is affected by the London labour market, as commuting is feasible (about 30 minutes by rail, costing around £4,000 for an annual season ticket).

The employment rate for women is relatively low, 58 per cent compared with 65 per cent nationally (see Table 12). This reflects a low economic activity rate and high unemployment rate for women. Male employment and unemployment rates are similar to the national average.

Table 12: Economic activity by gender, Oct. 2011–Sept. 2012, Luton

		Luton	Britain
All people	Economically active[a]	74	77
	In employment[a]	67	71
	Unemployed[b]	10	8
Males	Economically active[a]	82	83
	In employment[a]	75	76
	Unemployed[b]	9	8
Females	Economically active[a]	65	71
	In employment[a]	58	65
	Unemployed[b]	11	7

[a] % of those aged 16–64.
[b] % of those economically active aged 16 and over.
Source: Annual population survey.

Manufacturing employment is slightly higher than nationally, but still only accounts for 13 per cent of employment (see Table 15). Owing to the airport, employment in transport and communications is relatively high, also at 13 per cent of employment.

One employer, Luton Borough Council, dominates employment, with over 9,000 employees (Luton Borough Council, January 2013). Luton and Dunstable NHS is also large, with 3,000 employees. There are seven other organisations employing more than 1,000 people in Luton, including two which are airport-related.

Employment is more concentrated in low-skilled jobs than nationally. Twenty-four per cent of jobs are in the lowest level occupations (process, plant and machine operatives and elementary occupations), compared with 17 per cent nationally (see Table 16). This reflects the jobs of Luton residents, not the jobs available to Luton residents: owing to the accessibility of London, Luton residents have full access to high-level occupations and, according to stakeholders, African Caribbeans commute to access higher-level jobs. However, qualifications levels are relatively low: the population is less qualified than nationally and this applies throughout qualification levels (see Table 13).

Table 13: Qualifications, Oct. 2011–Sept. 2012, Luton*

	Luton	Britain
NVQ4 and above	28	33
NVQ3 and above	44	53
NVQ2 and above	59	70
NVQ1 and above	73	83
Other qualifications	9	7
No qualifications	18	11

* % of population aged 16–24.
Source: Annual population survey.

Earnings are slightly lower than nationally, by 6 per cent for both men and women (see Table 14).

Table 14: Median gross weekly earnings, full-time workers, 2012, Luton

	Luton	Britain
All people	**£482.9**	**£508.0**
Males	£514.7	£548.8
Females	£421.9	£449.6

Source: Annual survey of hours and earnings.

A comparison of Leicester and Luton[9]

The availability of the Census 2011 for England and Wales at the time of the study provided the opportunity to compare the labour market performance of the three ethnic minority groups between Leicester and Luton. The comparison was particularly interesting because, despite the areas having similar levels of economic demand (i.e. similar unemployment rates), economic activity and employment characteristics for each ethnic group differed between the two cities. Key differences are highlighted below. (For the data, see Tables 18 to 23.)

African Caribbean men and, more so, women perform better in the Luton than the Leicester labour market. For women:

- economic activity is higher and inactivity (excluding students) lower in Luton than in Leicester (64 per cent and 49 per cent of the population are economically active, respectively);[10]
- whilst the rate of employment is only slightly higher in Luton than in Leicester, far fewer African Caribbean women work part-time (32 per cent and 40 per cent of employees, respectively);
- African Caribbean women who are economically inactive are slightly more likely to be looking after the home or family in Luton than in Leicester;
- the socio-economic level of African Caribbean women is higher in Luton than in Leicester; and
- fewer African Caribbean women have never worked in Luton than in Leicester.

For African Caribbean men, the pattern is largely similar:

- economic activity is higher and inactivity (excluding students) lower in Luton than in Leicester (67 per cent and 60 per cent of the population are economically active, respectively);
- the unemployment rate is lower in Luton than in Leicester (15 per cent and 21 per cent of the economically active, respectively);
- self-employment is higher in Luton than in Leicester and more of the self-employed work full-time;
- the socio-economic level of African Caribbean men is slightly higher in Luton than in Leicester; and
- fewer African Caribbean men have never worked or are long-term unemployed in Luton than in Leicester.

For **Indians**, labour market performance is also better in Luton than in Leicester. For women, participation in employment is much higher in Luton than in Leicester:

- economic inactivity (once students are excluded) is much lower for Indian women in Luton than in Leicester (27 per cent and 39 per cent of the population are economically inactive, respectively)[11] and economically inactive women are much less likely to be looking after the home or

family in Luton than in Leicester (27 per cent and 34 per cent of the economically inactive, respectively);

- part-time employment is slightly lower for employed Indian women in Luton than in Leicester;
- the socio-economic level of Indian women is higher in Luton than in Leicester; and
- fewer Indian women have never worked in Luton than in Leicester (11 per cent and 19 per cent, respectively).

For Indian men, the main differences in employment (if students are excluded) are that:

- the socio-economic level of Indian men is much higher in Luton than in Leicester;
- part-time working is much lower, amongst both employees and the self-employed, in Luton than in Leicester; and
- long-term sickness and disability are much less common amongst economically inactive Indian men in Luton than in Leicester.

Although **Pakistanis** were studied qualitatively in Leicester and Glasgow and not in Luton, it is interesting to note that Pakistanis tended to be doing better in Leicester than in Luton, i.e. the opposite of the other two ethnic groups. In particular, Pakistani women were more likely to be economically active in Leicester than in Luton (35 per cent and 31 per cent, respectively) and were much less likely to have never worked (32 per cent and 45 per cent, respectively).[12] For men, the main difference was that the socio-economic level of Pakistani men was lower in Luton than in Leicester.[13] In addition, self-employment amongst Pakistani men was higher in Luton than in Leicester (36 per cent and 29 per cent of the employed, respectively).

Thus, despite similar demand conditions, ethnic groups differ in their activity and employment patterns across areas. The fact that Indians and African Caribbeans perform better in Luton and Pakistanis in Leicester suggests that there is not a simple link with economic demand to explain these differences.

Berthoud (2000) has suggested that the economic change in inner cities may have disproportionately disadvantaged people from ethnic minority groups and resulted in skill demands which ethnic minority groups are less able to fill. Whilst this may have occurred in all three case study areas, particular circumstances in Leicester may have disproportionately affected women's employment and economic activity.

According to stakeholders, many Indian migrant women had been able to operate socially and economically without learning English. The need for English was particularly low because of the high proportion of Indians in the population. Historically, many Indian women were employed in the hosiery industry, for which English had not been necessary. However, the hosiery industry declined and was replaced with service sector jobs requiring English language. This reduced employment opportunities for ethnic minority women who did not speak English. Stakeholders suggested this had contributed to the relatively low economic activity and employment rates of Indian women in Leicester. The effect would be expected to reduce with the growth of British-born generations. Although Glasgow and Luton had experienced major economic change since the migration of the relevant ethnic groups, changes of this nature were not reported to have occurred.

A final point should be made about self-employment. Self-employment for Pakistanis is much higher in both cities than nationally: 22 per cent in

Leicester and 28 per cent in Luton compared with 9 per cent for England and Wales (Census, 2011). (Stakeholders in Glasgow suggested that self-employment amongst Pakistanis might be lower than elsewhere, because Pakistani migrants had, in part, been attracted by public sector vacancies, notably on the buses, and that the history of self-employment was less significant.) Moreover, Luton has a relatively high rate of self-employment overall (15 per cent compared with the national average of 10 per cent; Census, 2011) and this high rate is seen not only amongst Pakistanis, but also amongst African Caribbeans (11 per cent compared with a national rate of 6 per cent). The evidence in the case studies suggested that familial self-employment could be a strong influence on labour market outcomes and this report is returned to in subsequent chapters.

The remainder of the report uses the information collected from stakeholders and key informants and the individual education and work histories to try to identify factors contributing to these differences. It also examines the same issues in Glasgow for Pakistanis to see whether these differ compared with Pakistanis in Leicester, potentially leading to differing outcomes.

3 EDUCATION AND TRAINING PRIOR TO ENTERING THE LABOUR MARKET

Educational achievement is a major determinant of labour market outcomes. School experience provides the basis for future career trajectories and circumscribes future opportunities. Careers assistance prior to entering the labour market also affects future career success (Hooley, *et al.*, 2011).

Educational attainment varies across ethnic groups, and does so in different ways at different stages of the education system (Tackey, *et al.*, 2011). Differences in attainment by ethnicity are thought to exist from pre-school. It has been suggested that children from some ethnic minority groups, including African Caribbean, make greater progress during pre-school than white British children (Sammons, *et al.*, 2002). Nevertheless, on the whole, ethnic minority children enter primary school with lower attainment levels than white British children.

Some groups of ethnic minority children, including Indian pupils, catch up or overtake white British children during primary school (Strand, 1999). Indian pupils continue to achieve higher on average than their white British peers throughout their compulsory education, whilst performance amongst African Caribbean pupils declines throughout their schooling (Cassen and Kingdon, 2007; Strand, 2011). A report by Ofsted (2013a) showed that in 2012, 50 per cent of African Caribbean pupils attained five GCSEs at grades A* to C, compared with 54 per cent of Pakistani pupils, 62 per cent of white British pupils, and 74 per cent of Indian pupils.

This chapter explores factors which affected educational achievement for people from our three ethnic groups in the three case study areas. It considers schooling, together with education and training, which continue directly after schooling. It first describes factors which affected school achievement and post-16 education. It then moves on to consider

aspirations and factors affecting aspirations, including careers advice and guidance.

The chapter draws on the evidence from the individual participants, stakeholders and key informants. It only considers the education of those who received at least some of their full-time continuous education in the UK.

Experience at school and subsequent full-time education

For our individual respondents, four educational routes were identified: leaving education at 16 (or earlier) with few or no qualifications; leaving education after taking A levels; continuing to college for vocational education and training; and continuing into higher education.

School and continued education and training experiences were influenced by a range of factors, some of which were related to ethnicity (such as racism and cultural expectations) and others which were not (such as class). Migration history was important, influencing achievement directly for migrants (through difficulties adapting to a different education approach and lack of qualification recognition) and indirectly for children of migrants, through lack of parental understanding of the educational system, which reduces the effectiveness of support for children's education. The role of parents in educational achievement is well established, with parental class and education affecting school achievement (Sullivan, *et al.*, 2013). This is related to informal education at home, the expectations inculcated in children and parents' ability to get the most from the system. For children with a migrant heritage, this link may be disrupted due to cultural differences between the migrant's and the majority culture and due to reduced parental knowledge about or ability to access the education system. These are discussed below.

Parental support for education

Parental support for their children's education took the form of encouragement and practical support. Both varied and, where these were not forthcoming, may have reduced educational achievement.

For some, parental encouragement had been strong. Others, though, reported a lack of parental support. For example, an African Caribbean man had left school at the age of 15 with no qualifications, which he felt was due to the fact that nobody had emphasised to him the importance of education. Some Pakistani women also described little encouragement to achieve or to continue in education beyond the compulsory leaving age. Indeed, some had continued into college and training in the face of opposition. However, several of these had subsequently dropped out. Previous research into the educational aspirations of South Asian women (Bagguley and Hussain, 2007), also suggests that parental expectations can play a substantial role in Pakistani women's educational advancement. It can, however, be possible for women to negotiate parental expectations with their own objectives by choosing 'appropriate' subjects or agreeing to study close to home.

Disparities were also found in the practical support given to education. This could result from lack of familiarity with the UK education system and from competing demands being placed on children. Lack of familiarity with the system was a recurring feature for migrant parents, although it was also present for some British-born parents.

An African Caribbean man in Luton said his parents, who had migrated from Jamaica in the 1960s, felt that the UK was a 'strange place' and

navigated their way in the UK through 'trial and error'. His parents had little understanding of the education system, and their priority was to keep him out of trouble with the police.

Parents' behaviour and expectations were shaped by their own educational experience. Stakeholders described how, in Pakistan, parents were not expected to be involved in their children's schooling, in part because the school was expected to provide everything and in part because this would be seen as challenging the status of the teacher, which was unacceptable. Therefore, parents might not think of doing this in Britain and there was concern that schools did not always compensate for this. Parental non-interference could have serious consequences.

A Pakistani stakeholder described how his daughter and her Pakistani friend had both narrowly failed to achieve the grades required to get into a high stream at their Glasgow school. This strongly reduced their chances of taking Highers (and so getting into university). He spoke to the school and his daughter was moved into the higher stream. Her friend's parents did not. The respondent thought this was, in part, because the parents did not realise the implications of the streaming.

Lack of English could also contribute to the lack of involvement. A Pakistani woman from Glasgow had had unrecognised dyslexia. Consequently, she had found school 'a horrible experience' and left without qualifications. Her parents had never sought help from the school, in part because of their lack of English.

Stakeholders in Glasgow believed that schools needed to be proactive in engaging Pakistani parents in order to improve their understanding of the system and to ensure more effective parental input in their children's education. The stakeholders believed too little of this occurred.

The degree of understanding of the system could also affect the quality of the school attended. As described above, qualification results in Leicester schools are low. Schools outside the city, according to stakeholders, achieve better results. They believed that East African Asian parents were more likely to take steps to ensure that their child went to a 'good' secondary school and that this was less common amongst Pakistanis and African Caribbeans. This was believed to be due to differences in knowledge of the system between ethnic groups, as well as financial differences.

Parents placing competing demands on a child's time and inadequate emphasis on homework may also affect achievement. Pakistani stakeholders in Glasgow believed this to be an issue for children of self-employed parents, with some children spending too much time working in the family business. They also suggested it was sometimes combined with parents placing too little importance on education, as in the case of a Pakistani woman in Glasgow who had had to work in the family business and to do chores when she was at school, which had affected her homework; she had left school without qualifications to look after her mother, who was sick.

The other demand on children's time, raised by Pakistani stakeholders in Glasgow and Leicester, was attendance at madrassas. One reported that children spent two hours per day, five days per week at a madrassa. Stakeholders' views differed on how this affected mainstream educational achievement. Research by the Institute for Public Policy Research (IPPR) suggested that the impact depended on the activities at the madrassa, but that most were likely to have a negative impact (Cherti and Bradley, 2011). However, it is unclear whether madrassa activities displace educationally useful activities, rather than other activities.

Stakeholders in Glasgow believed that schools needed to be proactive in engaging Pakistani parents in order to improve their understanding of the system and to ensure more effective parental input in their children's education.

Migration whilst in education

Children can find their education substantially disrupted by migration. The extent of the impact that migration has on education and integration into the education system depends on a number of factors including the child's age at the time of migration, the degree of support received by the child's teachers, the type of school, and whether the child has had to move school (Ackers and Stalford, 2004). Problems can arise for children being presented with a different education system, a different cultural context and, for children later in their education, lack of recognition of their qualifications and the costs of higher education. Language barriers between teachers and parents can lead to a lack of communication between the two parties, which can obstruct parents' knowledge of school practices and participation with the school (Sales, *et al.*, 2008).

Each of the above barriers to educational achievement was identified amongst the individual interviewees who had migrated before completing their education. Migrant respondents described difficulties because British education was different, including the style of teaching and the nature of what was taught (an African Caribbean woman described her schooling in the Caribbean as 'more practical'). Language, even for English speakers, could also be problematic. Two examples illustrate the problems. A Pakistani woman in Glasgow who had migrated as a child said:

"I remember sitting in Primary Five and the teacher asking me what my date of birth was, and I didn't know my date of birth. Even the basics I didn't know, and I just felt, mum and dad not knowing the language and the school not helping me, it was a horrible experience."

– Pakistani woman, Glasgow

An African Caribbean woman from Luton (who later returned to education and gained a degree) believed if she had gone from school to college she would have dropped out. She said:

"Coming from the Caribbean, … it's sort of life-changing, a sort of different way of life; you need to get to understand the culture and the language, so it's sort of like learning all over again. So… there was absolutely no chance that I could go from school to college or university. You really do need to acclimatise yourself with the language, because although you think you can speak English very well, it's sort of like all the little things that are quite quaint that you need to understand."

– African Caribbean woman, Luton

Moreover, some had difficulties because they no previous formal schooling, creating confusion about expectations and behaviour and affecting their ability to perform at school.

Lack of recognition of previous qualifications could severely disrupt education. In this study, this had occurred for East African Asians who had been forced to migrate. For example, an East African Asian woman in Luton found the three years of her (four-year) college degree in microbiology were not recognised in the UK. She was told that she would have to take

A levels before going on to attend college or university. She felt she neither had the time nor money to take her A levels and as a result moved directly into employment.

Such difficulties could be combined with the need to pay for higher education, leading to discontinuation of education following migration. In some cases, this combined with the need to contribute to the family income.

Class

Parental class is an important influence on educational achievement (Sullivan, *et al.*, 2013). Amongst the three ethnic groups included in this study, it appeared to affect parents' support for education and knowledge of the education system. McCabe, *et al.* (2013) argue that the likelihood of future employment success can be influenced by social networks that have been stratified by class lines, which reinforce socio-economic (dis)advantages. Evidence of this was found in the present research. Those who had had smooth transitions from school to university described having professional parents and/or friends with middle-class parents. These milieus were described as normalising expectations of university and good careers. In our sample, only those with a middle-class background progressed directly from school to university.

Teachers' support and racism

As is argued by Strand (2012), educational outcomes for ethnic minority pupils cannot be explained solely through class, neighbourhood or family influences. Teachers' own biases with regards to the ability levels of pupils from different ethnic minority groups also play a role in the underachievement of African Caribbean pupils in secondary school. Strand argues that these biases are also institutionalised within the assessment structure, in which African Caribbean pupils are significantly more likely to be placed in lower tiers than their white British peers. Recent research (Campbell, 2013) suggests that biases in teachers' judgements of pupils' abilities based on ethnicity can also be seen in primary schools.

Support from teachers and their expectations of pupils shaped our respondents' educational experiences and achievements. It was not clear the extent to which support and expectations were driven by the respondents' performance, behaviour and characteristics. Certainly, middle-class achievers reported either a good experience or no problems, although one (a Pakistani man in Glasgow) contrasted the supportive attention he received to a lack of attention received by other pupils. Others reported treatment which seemed likely to discourage educational achievement or which was based on racist stereotypes.

Discouraging treatment was described by some. For example, an African Caribbean man from Leicester said:

"I'm a black person brought up in Braunston back in the '70s, your skin's dark, you always got pushed to the back … and you raised your voice because you wanted attention: 'Get out of the class because you're disrupting the class.'"

– African Caribbean man, Leicester

A woman remembered lack of support and negative statements. She had wanted to study law (and went to university straight from school to do so), but felt her secondary-school teachers were more of a hindrance than a help, with one telling her she would 'never amount to anything'.

Some respondents pointed to the failure of schools to sufficiently engage with their students, particularly those experiencing difficulties. A man of Anglo-East African Asian heritage recalled support from his school as being 'diabolical'. The individual in question had experienced severe domestic violence during his childhood and as a result misbehaved in class:

"One thing I look back on now and I find really disconcerting is that rather than trying to address 'Why is this child misbehaving?', they would just put me in a room on my own somewhere, which would just perpetuate the problem … what they should have done really was they should have looked a bit more in-depth into it."

— Anglo-East African Asian man, Leicester

Ethnically homogeneous schools could be a problem for those from other ethnic groups than the main one in that school, and support was not always provided. An African Caribbean man from Leicester had felt isolated and struggled to find anybody in the school to whom he could relate; whilst he initially experienced racism from the other pupils in the school he developed ways himself to avoid racial harassment.

Racism was also perceived in teachers' expectations of performance. In particular, both stakeholders and individuals raised the issue of stereotyping of African Caribbean boys. A Luton stakeholder commented that African Caribbean boys faced a particular disadvantage to their education, with their teachers often 'channelling them' into sport. She witnessed this happening when she was in school and could also see this happening now in her son's school,

"The ones who excelled at sport were pushed into sport, and they weren't encouraged academically. So if they did not achieve in sport or went on to become a sportsperson, they were then floundering. So they were the ones that were probably in the lower-skilled jobs because they didn't have the opportunity to excel."

— Stakeholder, Luton

This resonated strongly with the experiences of one of the interviewees who focussed on sports at school at the expense of other subjects:

"A drama teacher told me that the only thing you're good at is out on the football field."

— African Caribbean man, Leicester

This respondent was ultimately unsuccessful in his attempt to build a long-term career in professional football, and went on to work in a series of low-paid jobs until his 40s, when he moved into more secure employment.

Early career choice

Young people's career aspirations are an important factor in their employment success in later life. Young people who are uncertain about their aspirations are significantly more likely to become NEET (Not in

Education, Employment or Training) in later life (Yates, *et al.*, 2010). Recent studies have challenged the idea that young people from ethnic minority backgrounds have low aspirations, showing that young people from Indian, Pakistani and African Caribbean backgrounds tend to have higher aspirations than their white British peers (Hutchinson, *et al.*, 2011). Research carried out by Kintrea, *et al.* (2011) argues that whilst many young people living in deprived areas have high aspirations, place nevertheless plays an important role in shaping young people's ambitions. The norms that young people are exposed to in their neighbourhoods can influence their expectations and future goals.

Our individual respondents described what their career aspirations had been when they had reached the end of compulsory education. Three types of career aspirations were identified: to work in the family business; to work in another specified occupation; and no specific aspirations. People with specific and with no occupationally specific aspirations were found at both high and lower educational levels.

At that stage, some had had career aspirations appropriate to their qualifications (whether with further training or not). These aspirations included pharmacy, childcare, nursing and the media. Others recognised the need to improve their qualifications to achieve their aspirations, although it did not appear as though the qualification gap was always likely to be bridged. Amongst those with no occupationally specific career aspirations, some said their priority was to gain financial independence and others to get training and widen their general experience.

Knowledge of career options, family demands and gender all influenced the careers pursued and these are discussed below. In addition, parents having their own business presented additional options to children, as well as seeming to result in limitations. Because of the high level of self-employment for the ethnic groups in the case study areas, this is discussed separately.

Knowledge of career options

Career choices made by young people are more likely to be based on media, peer and family influences than on formal careers guidance (Cassidy, *et al.*, 2006; Sherbert Research, 2009). Knowledge of career options and pathways to specific careers can therefore be narrow. For our respondents, limited knowledge affected the careers they considered and the ability to pursue chosen careers. Whilst generally limiting career choice, it could also lead to college dropout (as inappropriate courses were pursued), dead-end jobs and unemployment. There were a number of factors constraining knowledge.

Formal careers advice and guidance at school were reported as non-existent, ineffective, insufficient, limited to advice on college rather than careers advice, or limited to particular lines of work. Indeed, only one respondent said advice had been useful. Some said it had been positively discouraging, pushing them towards low-skilled careers, towards careers of no interest and away from the careers to which they aspired. Some of the consequences appeared to be dropping out of college courses, pursuit of routes of little benefit to reach the career goals, the need for later retraining and subsequent multiple career change. Since these respondents were at school, substantial improvements had been made in the careers support provided in schools and to young people generally (e.g. through Connexions), although these are being reversed by recent policy changes.

In recent years, policy in this area has emphasised the provision of impartial careers advice, and since 2012 schools have been legally obliged to offer independent careers guidance. Previous research has suggested

Formal careers advice and guidance at school were reported as non-existent, ineffective, insufficient, limited to advice on college rather than careers advice, or limited to particular lines of work.

that the model of impartial careers advice provision has at its forefront a commitment to promote equality by actively challenging stereotypes and pupils' own pre-conceived ideas about suitable occupations (Hutchinson, *et al.*, 2011). However, an Ofsted evaluation suggests that few schools are adequately implementing this strategy, and careers guidance provision remains lacking in breadth and quality (Ofsted, 2013b). Careers advice remains inadequate for many young people, and stereotyping continues to be a live issue in the provision of careers advice to young people from ethnic minority backgrounds (Benetto, 2009; Hutchinson, *et al.*, 2011).

The lack of formal assistance meant that, for career choice and information on career pathways, individuals were reliant on informal advice, from parents, peers or wider social networks, and on their own ability to negotiate the labour market and education and training systems. Experiences were disparate, influenced by individuals' backgrounds.

Parents were often reported as providing little direction, mainly limited to encouraging their children to go to college, but not extending to the subject of study or career choice. Peers for some were influential. For example, a Pakistani man in Glasgow described following his middle-class peers, in doing a vocational-focussed course at university. An African Caribbean woman in Luton said:

"I'm not sure [why I chose childcare], probably because everyone else was doing it, I was just following the crowd really."

— African Caribbean woman, Luton

Wider social networks could also provide guidance. For example, a Pakistani woman resisting working in her family's business received limited, but useful, informal advice (to work for the Council) from one of the business's employees. This was taken up by her careers advisor, resulting in a long-term career with the Council in administration.

Parents and other family members could be useful in providing information on career routes when a young person's career choice coincided with their own career or knowledge. Examples of this were found for the professions: a young Pakistani man in Glasgow, influenced by his peers to pursue pharmacy, was able to get advice from his uncle, a pharmacist. Similarly, East African Asians in the sample often had parents working in the professions influencing them to follow similar careers.

Class was an influence, affecting knowledge of career routes, as described above for professionals. At the other end of the class scale, a Pakistani woman in Glasgow interested in a media career (which she only pursued in later life) received no help from the school careers service. She said:

"My parents aren't particularly educated in any way. I come from a very, very working-class background. So when it came to guidance from the home, it wasn't there. So, for me, going into the media I always saw as something way up there: 'I couldn't do that.' … I didn't realise [the] options. Media's huge, and then all you've got in your head is media when you're young, and there's nobody that explains that to you."

— Pakistani woman, Glasgow

Family demands

Family demands could restrict career options. For some, the need to contribute to family finances precluded continuing in education and resulted in early entry to the labour market. This was found to be a particular issue for recent migrants, who sometimes also needed to support family in their country of origin.

Other participants in our sample, all of whom were Pakistani women, had put careers on hold because of the need to care for sick relatives.

Gender

Whilst gender affects career choice generally, it appeared to have a more limiting influence for Pakistani respondents. Childcare appeared to be an acceptable (and encouraged) option for girls, as was the family business, but other careers were not encouraged within our sample. Pakistani boys in the sample, on the other hand, were encouraged to go to university or, as with girls, enter the family business.

The role of the family business

Family businesses played an important role in career development and labour market outcomes for East African Asians and Pakistanis in our localities.[14] For some, entering the family business was seen as a positive opportunity and welcomed. Others were less keen. Irrespective of aspirations, the family business could be seen as expanding or curtailing opportunities.

For those respondents who entered into the family business, the aspirations and reasons for making such a decision were mixed. In some cases, there was enthusiasm. For example, an East African Asian man noted that although his family had 'expected' him to join the business, which owned and operated petrol stations, he was keen to do so. Another East African Asian man spoke of how it was a joint decision between him and his father to set up a travel agency and that he saw it as an 'opportunity and simply took advantage of it'. In other cases, such a decision appeared to be largely related to the fact that it was an easy route into employment and, in some cases, because of lack of other options due to insufficient qualifications. In others, the respondents had felt pressure to enter the business, although this was not always complied with. The pressure to work in the family business was sometimes resisted. For example, a Pakistani woman had left school with no qualifications and two ambitions: not to work in the family shop and to get an education:

"I wanted to gain experience, I wanted to know the world outside, I wanted to go to the city centre myself and just explore the world myself."

– Pakistani woman, Glasgow

Despite being able to earn more in the shop, coming under pressure from her brothers and having little idea of work options, she got a place on the Youth Training Scheme at the Council and continued to work there until she had children.

Others had entered the family business reluctantly and had planned over many years how to move out. In one case, a Pakistani young man in Glasgow had felt obliged to work in a new family business because he (and not his family) had the skills as he had been working in the same type of business whilst at school.

The impact of family businesses on career choice and opportunities may be wider than providing an employment opportunity. Some stakeholders

suggested that the family businesses could inhibit the development of recognised employment experience for other jobs. They described how children and young people would work in the family business, rather than as an employee elsewhere, and that their employment experience was disregarded by potential future employers, thus reducing their employment options. Some suggested this could be a reasonable response from a recruiter, as they believed that working in a family business was less of a guarantee of having developed general employment skills (as, for example, time keeping, sickness and performance might be dealt with rather differently in a family business than in other workplaces). It was also suggested that young people themselves did not always make the most of their family-business experience in applying for jobs, even to the extent of omitting it entirely.

Key points

A number of key issues arose from the research regarding how well schooling and continued education provided the foundation for decent employment. First, it is important to note the diversity of experience, not only between ethnic groups, but also within them. Parental background is a vital aspect at this age and, to a large extent, those with greater social capital were better able to ensure a better educational foundation. However, cultural factors, parental knowledge and migration also played their part.

The quality of education received can be affected by parental understanding of and interaction with the school system. Whilst schools themselves try to provide appropriate education for their pupils and react to problems, the UK system also relies on parents raising issues and responding to their concerns. Parents of participants in the study were often described as supporting education and their children's aspirations, but not providing any practical assistance. This reflects Carter-Wall and Whitfield's (2012) findings, which challenge the idea that parents from disadvantaged backgrounds have low aspirations for their children, but assert that these parents often do not have the resources, knowledge or confidence to provide adequate support. Indeed, in the present research, it seemed important that both parents were assisted to engage more effectively with their children's education and that schools were more aware of the need to be more proactive with some groups. These issues can be exacerbated by language difficulties.

We identified the influence of family demands on schooling and continued education. In particular, working in the family business was described as restricting schoolwork, and the need to care for family members prevented continuation in education (and withdrawal from the labour market) with long-term implications for careers. A related issue, for Muslim pupils, was the effect of attendance at madrassas on school achievement. As referred to, the effect varied with the nature of the madrassa. It is important for parents and schools to be aware of the effect of these other demands on children and to seek solutions which address conflicting needs.

Migration, a narrow range of parental employment experience and restricted social networks, all resulted in limited informal careers support. This increases the importance of formal careers advice. It should be noted that these limitations were found for children of second-generation ethnic minority groups, as well as the children of migrants. In some cases, this meant that the person had not pursued their aspirations. It may have also led to course dropout.

The local prevalence of self-employment amongst some ethnic minority groups is important. Self-employment rates were very high amongst Pakistanis in Leicester and Luton, around double the national average (Census, 2011), and were reported by stakeholders to be high in Glasgow. Self-employment in Luton for other ethnic minority groups was higher than the national average. Whilst a family business can provide an additional career opportunity, it may also restrict education (through the demands of working in the family business), career opportunities and choice. This seems more likely to be detrimental where businesses are small.

Cultural differences affecting women's labour market activities were apparent. Family support and differing gender roles seemed to be stressed, particularly for Pakistanis, and, as evidenced by labour market participation rates, by Indians. In addition, the Pakistani community, at least in Glasgow, seemed to be more isolated. This impinges on definitions of success and ambitions for careers and so is likely to affect outcomes. This type of issue is at the heart of the tension between promoting multiculturalism and promoting integration (see, for example, Vasta, 2007) and needs careful consideration in the development of policy.

Racism and the impact of teachers' low expectations caused problems. The cases described were of a nature that it might be hoped should have been addressed by changes in school practices. This could not be determined in this study but other research suggests that stereotyping of and low expectations from pupils from some ethnic minority groups remain in primary and secondary schools today (Strand, 2012; Campbell, 2013). This highlights the importance of continued policies to tackle racism.

Additional issues were apparent for children who had migrated to the UK. These included the additional support required to overcome large-scale educational and cultural change, the importance of which is not only a school issue, as adults wishing to return to education after settling in to their new environment also need support to enable this. Other difficulties were caused by the lack of recognition of previous qualifications. Whilst substantial improvements have been made in this area, the problem remains, and assistance would be useful for those who need to retake and improve qualifications.

The role of place

What are the implications of the above for the role of place in poverty amongst people from ethnic minority groups? Obviously, the quality of education and of careers support vary across areas and so the outcomes for people from ethnic minority groups (as well as from the ethnic majority) will vary. However, for people from ethnic minority groups, particularly migrants, there was evidence that knowledge of and interaction with the education system and knowledge of career options may be particularly limited, thus reducing the effectiveness of the systems for ethnic minority children. The extent to which education policies (of local authorities, schools and others) support ethnic groups and migrants and non-migrants to benefit equally from education and careers support will vary and so differences in outcomes by ethnicity and migrant history will result. Moreover, the knowledge of people from ethnic minority groups may vary by locality. The evidence suggested that knowledge was likely to be least amongst migrants, but that it was likely to also be more limited the greater the degree of social segregation. It also suggested that self-employment might contribute to social segregation and limitations on knowledge. For Pakistanis, and to a lesser extent East African Asians, who participated in the study, respondents described their migrant parents as being socially segregated both by culture

Whilst a family business can provide an additional career opportunity, it may also restrict education (through the demands of working in the family business), career opportunities and choice.

and by self-employment. Such social segregation seems likely to reduce parents' knowledge of the educational system and the labour market (as there is less opportunity to learn from non-migrants) and, therefore, the degree to which parents can support their children's education and career development. Self-employment appeared to exacerbate social segregation, especially where labour was limited to family businesses. Thus we might expect ethnic minority groups to perform less well in education the greater the social segregation and the greater the concentration on self-employment (or, at least, small business self-employment).[15]

4 EMPLOYMENT

The pattern of employment in the case study areas was described in Chapter 2, with details of employment by ethnicity for Leicester and Luton from the 2011 Census. Not only were there differences in employment patterns between the three ethnic groups, but also for each group there were differences between Luton and Leicester.

Despite overall unemployment being similar in Leicester and Luton, African Caribbeans and Indians in Luton were less likely to be unemployed than those in Leicester. This applied to both women and men. Pakistanis showed the opposite pattern, performing better in Leicester than in Luton. Other differences were also apparent. Indian women in Leicester were almost twice as likely as those in Luton to have never worked whereas for Pakistani women the pattern was reversed, with almost 50 per cent more Pakistani women in Luton compared with Leicester having never worked (see Table 22).

In this section, we examine the employment histories of individuals and the information provided by stakeholders and other key informants to try to identify factors which may contribute to these differing labour market outcomes. Below, we describe the employment histories of the individual participants. We then turn to the main factors which appeared to influence employment outcomes.

Employment patterns

The employment patterns of the individual respondents in the study may be classified into four main types: traditional achievers, late achievers, low-level achievers and insecure workers. The characteristics of these four career patterns and the factors influencing them are described below. All, other than traditional achievers, include periods in low-skilled work. Multiple job changes were common whilst in low-skilled work, particularly when employment was combined with periods of unemployment.

Within our small sample, some differences were found between the three ethnic groups, with East African Asians tending to be more successful and to

have better support, African Caribbeans to experience multiple job changes and for gender influences to be most apparent for Pakistanis. For this sample, too, there seemed to be some locational differences, with African Caribbean women in Luton more likely to make successful late career changes, particularly following a return to education. These differences should not be interpreted as representative, however, and we return to the issue of locational influence in later chapters.

Traditional achievers

Traditional achievers were in continuous employment and were either in professional careers from the outset, in jobs with good progression routes or employed in their family business. People in this group described relatively high levels of support from family, friends, school or college, which had set them on a promising career trajectory from the start. Whilst determination and a strong work ethic drove some to success, this was not apparent for all.

Those in professional jobs tended to have access to family and friends with knowledge of the same professions. Family and friends were also a useful source of support for those entering self-employment and for developing their business.

This was complemented by advice and guidance at work. Both colleagues and managers could be useful. One East African Asian man in Luton described how a colleague in his first job after graduation had acted as a mentor and had 'shaped and guided' him. Another, an East African Asian man in Leicester who had begun working as a correspondence clerk, had quickly worked his way up the company ranks to become a successful accountant for the company. He cited his boss as a key figure in his progression, explaining how he had encouraged him to upgrade his knowledge and skills so that he was able to qualify as an accountant.

For those in self-employment, wider networking contributed to business growth and development. For example, an East African Asian business owner in Luton working in the human resource industry indicated that her involvement both in local and international networking organisations had provided opportunities for her to promote her business, particularly in its early stages. Others received valuable support through membership of employer representative bodies.

Traditional achievers did not always remain in one career. Prompts to change included interest, earnings and returning after maternity leave. For example, an East African Asian man in Leicester left teaching to run his own post office. This was principally due to the low salary in teaching. It seems likely that this career move was prompted by friends who owned post offices and provided him with advice and support on how to set up his business. An East African Asian woman in Luton decided to move from carrying out administrative work for the NHS to working as a community support worker after developing an interest in the field on the job.

However, not all traditional achievers were happy with their careers. Some were disappointed because they had been unable to pursue their career of choice. This had occurred for some East African Asians who had had their later education or early career disrupted by forced migration. Problems arose either due to qualifications not being recognised in the UK or their having to curtail their training or education in order to earn and contribute to family income. For this group, whilst educational and migration barriers had not resulted in low pay, unemployment and poverty, it had led to lower career satisfaction.

Formal support was sought only by respondents who were in self-employment. Two respondents from Luton described having accessed business support through the local Chamber of Commerce, with a third

in Luton indicating that they did not feel the Chamber of Commerce was sufficiently geared towards supporting small businesses. A further individual had accessed business support through Business Link in Luton before the organisation had been phased out.

Late achievers

Late achievers progressed into more successful careers following a period of low-skilled work and, for some, periods of unemployment. This group had various experiences which limited their early career choice: lack of success at school, low educational aspirations, lack of knowledge of career options or of career pathways. Whilst their family and friends might have been supportive, they had been unable to provide information and practical career support. Determination, often combined with guidance and support from their employer, helped these individuals move into better jobs.

Some had made several major career changes, completed a degree and moved into higher-level jobs. A couple of examples from Luton illustrate the pattern.

An African Caribbean woman in Luton reported being pushed towards the police by her school careers adviser (despite being keen to be a PE teacher). She left the police, finding it racist and not suited to her young age, and was unemployed. She did a secretarial course, then trained as a nurse. She commuted to London to work, but this became impractical when she had children and she again became unemployed. She then did a degree in social policy, out of interest for the subject. This led her to working in community involvement and empowerment.

Another African Caribbean woman in Luton did administrative work, tried nursing, then worked for the Inland Revenue, before doing a degree and postgraduate training to become a teacher. She worked in both Luton and London, finding the latter more amenable to African Caribbeans and to her ideas. However, she tired of commuting and so set up her own business in Luton, employing staff to teach excluded children.

Key characteristics of this group seemed to be a determination to be employed, to seek employment they liked and to take challenges, together with external factors not entirely blocking their success.

As with some traditional achievers, some late achievers had had their education or careers disrupted by migration. Initially, they might have found work in any possible field, but then used their previous experience or contacts to progress.

Employer support for progression guided employees through the system and helped to overcome the lack of knowledge. This was very important in encouraging progression, as well as in providing training and opportunities for promotion. Individuals receiving employer support appeared to be ambitious and it might be assumed that they were good at their job. Individuals described having managers who were good mentors, had discussions with them about long-term career development, provided training and encouragement to return to education. Some developed substantially in their existing organisations or moved on to promotion elsewhere, whereas others moved into different careers after completing a degree.

Family, too, could be very important. For example, an African Caribbean woman in Luton wanted to return to work after time out for childcare and had previously had low-level factory work. Her mother had helped her get a summer-school job (in a school in which the mother worked), as her mother thought this might lead to a better career. The daughter was encouraged by the head teacher, resulting in progression to teaching assistant and related

Level 3 training, followed by a move into community and youth work and a degree.

However, determination could compensate for lack of other support, as in the case of an East African Asian woman in Luton who had immigrated to the UK midway through her degree in microbiology and was unable to afford to continue her education. She initially began working in administrative work, and later moved into human resources before eventually opening her own successful human resource consultancy. She attributes her success to a combination of luck, hard work and determination.

Supportive employers could prompt career change, as could maternity, examples of which are given above. For some, chance played a role in shaping their future employment pathways. For example, an East African Asian man in Leicester had left school with poor A-level qualifications and had subsequently drifted in and out of employment for a number of years. A chance involvement with a local trade union in Leicester led to him becoming interested in employment practices and working in human resources for a number of years before deciding to set up a small human resource consultancy.

Whilst, the late achievers had successfully developed their careers, it was clear that lack of knowledge of career paths could slow progression, resulting in multiple job changes and taking courses which, ultimately, led nowhere. Lack of general advice and guidance was apparent: individuals often decided on vocational training with no guidance.

Low-level achievers

Employment in low-level occupations may be a permanent state or a transient phase, prior to becoming a late achiever. Some saw their low-level job as satisfactory and matching their skills. For others, it represented underemployment. The satisfied, but lower paid, included both people who had had relatively straightforward routes to their current jobs and those who had had more rocky routes.

Lack of family support, difficulties at home, lack of contacts in their chosen field, a lack of knowledge of the labour market (and lack of careers advice) all played a role in making progression difficult.

The relative success of the first generation of East African Asians, particularly in the area of small business, did not necessarily result in equal or greater success for those who were British-born, and low-level careers were pursued within family businesses. Three individuals whose parents or extended family owned small businesses did not progress to further education and went on to work within the family business. In one case, the reason appears to be linked to a lack of qualifications as well as perhaps an expectation from family members, since the individual had worked in the shop since a young age. In another case, the individual, mistakenly, believed this would help her gain employment in the future.

Insecure workers

A number of respondents suffered long-term or multiple periods of unemployment. All were unemployed at the time of interview, with some trying to set up their own business whilst (legitimately) receiving benefits.

Like the late achievers, lack of success at school, low educational aspirations, lack of knowledge of career options or how to achieve these seemed to contribute to their poor employment performance. Whilst their family and friends might be supportive, they had been unable to provide information and practical support, and these respondents had entered jobs requiring low or no qualifications.

Some may have merely not had the same degree of luck as others in the study, whilst others seemed to have similar characteristics, including determination, as those with successful late careers. It is possible that their careers will progress to be successful.

However, for some, other factors suggested that their insecure employment might be more persistent. A lack of understanding or acceptance of employment norms and demands appeared to be a barrier for some. For example, an African Caribbean man in Leicester was repeatedly dismissed during probationary periods. Others failed at interview because they objected to what they saw as personal questions. In one case, this seemed to be related to concern over having a criminal record, but in another no reason was apparent.

A lack of more general understanding of recruitment processes was another barrier. For example, a Pakistani who had migrated to the UK two years previously was unemployed but relied on a very limited range of job-seeking methods (internet-advertised jobs requiring internet application). Spoken communication in English was difficult and may have been the reason for this limited job-seeking approach. However, those moving in and out of employment seemed generally to be familiar with, and used, the range of appropriate job-search methods.

Others seemed to lack direction, taking many courses and changing their pathways multiple times. Self-employment seemed to be turned to by some in desperation, rather than as a positive choice.

Finally, some had major personal employment barriers, such as a serious criminal record, drug dependency or, perhaps, behavioural problems.

None seemed to have access to useful informal sources of support and advice. The Jobcentre was used by most when they were unemployed, but the usefulness of the support appeared to vary. Where the need was for the identification of vacancies in low-skilled jobs, support appeared adequate. But for others, this was not the case. The needs of those with aspirations (and skills) beyond a low-paid job were not necessarily met. For example, an African Caribbean woman in Luton, with Level 3 qualifications, believed she was not being provided with information on vacancies in relevant areas of work. An African Caribbean man in Luton described having to fight for support to set up his own business because, he thought, his adviser did not believe he was serious about self-employment, even though he had been working with a partner to set up a business and had already established a charity as the vehicle for this. Others felt that the assistance was cursory and some of the reports seemed to suggest that underlying employment barriers were not been being addressed. Assistance for some unemployed respondents seemed to need to extend beyond job-search skills to address their general employment behaviour and recognition of language problems.

Moreover, some did not sign on (or were employed) and were consequently excluded from Jobcentre programmes. These people either did not use the Jobcentre at all or only used it for identification of vacancies. Stakeholders suggested a cultural resistance to signing on amongst Pakistanis. An African Caribbean man in Leicester (who was repeatedly unemployed, after failing workplace probationary periods) objected to the information required by the Jobcentre as 'intrusive'. This was not explained, but may have been related to him having a criminal record or to literacy difficulties.

Employed and unemployed alike sometimes preferred other formal support providers. The African Caribbean man just referred to, who disliked the Jobcentre, was happy with support from a voluntary organisation, the African Caribbean Citizens Forum (ACCF).

"They'll sit at the side of me and they'll help me, then they'll give me the phone ... If it's to phone for an interview or if it's to fill it in they'll help me because ... reading some of them I can't understand."

– African Caribbean man, Leicester

However, his greatest need appeared to be for in-work support, which did not seem to be provided. In Glasgow, the Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre (EMEC) was described by stakeholders and some respondents as providing very good assistance to those with poor job-search skills, including to people looking to change their job. It had lists of vacancies, helped with CVs and completing application forms, provided training in interview skills and followed up employers to identify the weaknesses of unsuccessful applicants and helped them to improve. However, it had been closed when local authority grants were cut.

Factors affecting employment outcomes

Whilst prior educational achievement, determination and luck affected employment outcomes, a number of other factors had a major influence on these outcomes. Key was being able to negotiate the labour market system, including having the knowledge and resources to so do. Other major influences were gender and racism.

Understanding and negotiating the labour market system

Understanding the employment system (career paths, recruitment and progression processes and employment behaviour) and having the skills and resources to negotiate it successfully are important for getting a job, progressing or making a career change. Those who had the knowledge and skills had a much better chance of securing higher-paid and better jobs. Those who did not seemed to flounder; they either remained in low-level or insecure work or went through multiple career changes, courses and jobs before being able to find suitable employment (the late achievers). Those in insecure work sometimes also lacked understanding of employment requirements or understanding of recruitment processes.

Sources of support
Once in the labour market, people continued to rely on family and friends for labour market information. Just as for initial career choice, this could be useful, but often highly limited. Migrants, children of migrants and those who operated in more segregated social environments (or whose parents did) were most likely to be disadvantaged. Migrants with poor English-language skills faced an additional barrier.

The more formal sources of information were employers, colleges, voluntary sector organisations, and the Jobcentre. As was found in the 2010 National Adult Learner Survey, the most commonly used source of adult careers advice was employers (Gloster, *et al.*, 2013). The significance of employers for advice was reflected in our interviews, which suggested that employers (and, to some extent, colleagues) were a very important source of guidance and support for development within a career related to the organisation. Colleges' information seemed to be largely restricted to details of potential courses and so did not assist with career choice (prior to doing a course), which may have contributed to the multiple career changes of some respondents. Jobcentres were criticised

for directing people towards low-level jobs, irrespective of their skills. Formal support for movement into self-employment appeared to be available, although coverage varied between areas. Overall, there appeared to be a lack of access to careers guidance through formal careers services. However, this tendency to obtain advice through informal sources reflected the pattern in the wider population (Gloster, *et al.*, 2013).

Some people lacked basic information and resources to access jobs effectively or to retain them. These included the insecure workers in our sample, but also some who wanted to make a career change. Access to assistance appeared mainly limited to unemployed people. For those who signed on, the Jobcentre was the main source of support, although its effectiveness varied, particularly for those who required assistance beyond job-search skills, such as help to address employment behaviour and language problems. Moreover, some could not access the range of Jobcentre services because they did not sign on. Of particular relevance here were migrants and, according to stakeholders, Pakistanis, who were believed to be resistant to signing on. Whilst non-statutory support, sometimes aimed at specific communities, was available in some areas, there was evidence that public sector cuts had reduced provision.

Access to formal advice and guidance seemed particularly important for Pakistanis in Glasgow and Leicester because continuing migration kept renewing the numbers unfamiliar with the labour market. It also seemed particularly important for women. For many, networks were limited to their own community and they had a fairly restricted range of employment experience, sometimes self-employment alone.

Networking

Social networks can help people into employment, assisting identification of vacancies (Hudson, *et al.*, 2013). However, networks tend to lead people into similar work to those with whom they network. Given that people from ethnic minority groups are more concentrated in lower-quality jobs, networks can reinforce this concentration in low-paid and insecure work (McCabe, *et al.*, 2013). The importance of networking and the quality of networks was apparent amongst the individual respondents.

Successful networking helped individuals access support from a wider group than their family and friends. Networking was at its most formal amongst the self-employed, with employer representative bodies, whether local, national or international, providing formal routes for networking. Networking had led to the successful establishment of businesses. It was also important for business growth and development, providing market information and skill development.

For career change and, perhaps to a lesser extent, progression, networking could be very useful. A number of the late achievers (and potential late achievers) appeared to be adept networkers, developing useful career contacts through political organisations and voluntary work, for example. The successful networkers had the confidence to seek advice from others and seemed to spread their net fairly widely. Networks were not ethnic specific, an important factor, given the extent to which mainstream employment and managerial positions are dominated by white British people (Clark and Drinkwater, 2007).

"I'm not a kind of shy of person — I just go up to people and talk to them and speak to the managers and things like that so that's

why … they see that I'm willing to learn and also, I mean, I'm a very reliable kind of person."

– Pakistani man, Glasgow

"So it's just talking to other folk in that particular institution or in that community group. Just talking to folk, you think, 'Maybe I could do that,' or, 'Maybe I could do that.' That sort of thing. So there's not somebody – there's not a careers adviser sitting there telling me what I can and what I can't do. So that's how decisions have been made."

– Pakistani woman, Glasgow

Amongst those respondents who were looking for work, or who spoke of previous attempts to find work, the role of social networks in enabling people to find employment was also notable. In some cases, this appeared to be the principal route through which they found employment. This was particularly true for those individuals with few qualifications and whose career trajectories were more *ad hoc*.

Gender

Employment outcomes are shaped by gender (affecting employment participation, occupational patterns, pay and progression). The data analysis above showed major differences in employment by gender between the ethnic groups, with Pakistani women having much higher rates of inactivity than women in other ethnic groups, and African Caribbean women performing rather better than African Caribbean men. Here we look at some elements of how gender may have affected performance. As our interest, ultimately, is place, we do not go into details of the well-known issues which affect gender gaps in employment (for example, motherhood, gender discrimination, childcare), unless they may be related to place.

Gender differences were marked for Pakistanis. Stakeholders suggested their culture emphasised men as the breadwinners and women as carers, and also limited the type of jobs which were acceptable, particularly for women. For women, employment in childcare was strongly favoured (but had the disadvantage of being poorly paid); unsuitable work included nursing because it entailed looking after men outside the family. Pakistani men had appeared to feel under pressure for career achievement, whether they had been successful or not. One of the stakeholders suggested that husbands' opposition reduced wives' economic activity, whilst limiting women's contact with men either prevented employment or greatly reduced the range of opportunities. The latter was reported to be declining in importance. Expectation of future withdrawal from the labour market for caring responsibilities seemed to result in reduced career commitment for Pakistani women. At the same time, stakeholders suggested that homeworking and working in the family business was relatively high and might mean participation was under-recorded. Certainly, in our small sample of Pakistani women, childcare employment was favoured and withdrawal for caring reasons both lengthy and common. This accords with Dex and Ward (2007), who found that Pakistani women (alongside Bangladeshi women) who were employed when they became pregnant, were more likely than women of other ethnic groups to report that their job had finished prior to their giving birth.

In contrast, African Caribbean women in our small sample had either returned to work after maternity leave or returned to work within five years. The need to work closer to home was of particular importance in Luton, as it could cut out the wider employment opportunities in London. In some cases, this led to unemployment or restricted occupational choice. In addition, as some African Caribbean respondents found that London had provided more inclusive work experiences, restriction to jobs in Luton could feel alienating.

Racism

Racism in employment was taken for granted by many interviewed in the study, viewed as affecting recruitment, training, progression and other treatment within a job. Failure of management to respond to complaints was also reported.

Greatest concern was expressed about the public sector (notably local authorities and the National Health Service). In two areas, some ethnic minority groups were reported as being under-represented either generally or in higher-level jobs. The latter was attributed by respondents to the importance of networks for promotion and that people from ethnic minority groups could be poorly networked to white decision-makers. This corresponds with findings from research carried out by Hudson, *et al.* (2013), which suggests that, in some organisations, there is a gap between formal equal opportunities policies and actual workplace practices. This can include discriminatory progression procedures that are based around the employee's social connections in the workplace rather than purely on merit.

In one case study area, stakeholders reported that the Council attributed the under-representation of people from ethnic minority groups amongst its employees to a lack of ethnic minority applicants. The stakeholders believed there was an adequate supply of qualified potential candidates. They, variously, did not believe there was a lack of applicants or saw a lack of applicants as the fault of the Council. Indeed, stakeholders in another area reported that their Council had successfully increased ethnic minority applications and had raised representation, although only at lower levels. The overall impression was that stakeholders believed there was a lack of willingness to promote racial equality on the part of some public sector organisations.

Individuals' accounts of racism included teachers experiencing racism from both pupils and colleagues. However, the problem was wider. In education, an African Caribbean teacher described how teachers in Luton were predominantly white and lived outside the town. She felt they had little understanding of their black pupils. She felt 'frozen out' by her all-white colleagues, who failed to respond to her ideas about teaching black children. She had also noticed that the few African Caribbeans who were in more senior posts were in the most difficult schools. For these reasons she mainly worked in London, commuting.

The need for African Caribbeans in Luton to commute to London for good jobs due to racism was reported by a number of interviewees in Luton, with one saying, 'They are not appreciated in Luton, they have to commute.' Others said, 'People have to assimilate and pretend to be this certain way to get accepted.' Respondents' experience of Luton and London labour markets seemed to support the idea that acceptance of cultural diversity was greater in London and resulted in better employment opportunities for African Caribbeans at least, including at higher levels.

"From my experience I've done London and I've worked in Luton, I don't think we're appreciated in Luton. I used to see born and

The need for African Caribbeans in Luton to commute to London for good jobs due to racism was reported by a number of interviewees in Luton.

bred African Caribbean people in the station commuting to London and they still do it now, because they get paid more. But it's not only about the opportunities, it's also about being yourself, I've found that in Luton I've had to suppress who I am in order to survive."

– Stakeholder, Council employee, Luton

Transport and deprivation

Locational concentration into highly deprived areas could result in reduced opportunities. An important aspect of this was found in Leicester, where public transport was reported to stop in the early evening (owing to business company crime concerns) in an area of high Pakistani concentration. This added to problems of shift work for residents of this area. This reflects findings from Tunstall, *et al.* (2012) which highlight the importance of accessible public transport. It is not only workers and the unemployed who view this as important, but also employers, who can be more likely to hire employees for whom commuting to work will be easier. This will vary with place.

Key points

Adult careers advice and guidance

It would be useful to conduct further research on the prevalence of career development and change amongst people from ethnic minority groups. The study suggested that career change may be greater (and needs to be greater) to compensate for lower earlier achievement. Some people could negotiate this well through access to informal support and their networking skills. However, others could not and found their niche (or not) through trial and error. Just as for initial career choice, informal sources and networks were useful for some but highly limited for others. Migrants, children of migrants and those who operated in more segregated social environments (or whose parents did) were most likely to be disadvantaged.

Access to formal advice and guidance was lacking. Greater and more effective provision would be useful. This is particularly important for some ethnic groups with lower achievement in the labour market, who have less access to informal sources of information, due to more restricted labour market information.

Similar issues applied in relation to job search and employability skills. Although some unemployed people found the Jobcentre provided useful support, others did not and were happier with support from ethnic minority community organisations. Moreover, there may be a problem of eligibility for support from the Jobcentre, if some groups are less likely to sign on when unemployed.

The need for support is likely to be greater amongst migrants (and the children of migrants) and higher the more recent the migration and amongst those in (or with parents in) more segregated social environments.

Maternity and children

The effects of children on mothers' employment are well known: withdrawal from the labour market, occupational downgrading on return, part-time working and reduced career opportunities. For this study, a number of issues were apparent.

Pakistani women seemed more likely to leave employment rather than to return after maternity leave. This is more likely to have a greater detrimental

effect on employment long-term. Moreover, return to employment is likely to be discouraged and to be less successful the more limited knowledge is of the labour market. As discussed above, informal advice and guidance and knowledge of the labour market may be relatively limited for Pakistanis. Both greater labour market withdrawal and more limited informal support suggest that there may be a greater need for formal advice and guidance for women returners in the Pakistani community.

Rather differently, there was evidence from East African Asian and African Caribbean respondents of maternity being an opportunity and spur to change career, including to gaining a degree. This may be more common amongst mothers from ethnic minority groups, as racism in education and careers advice, or, for migrants, disruption to education, will have led to educational underachievement. Certainly, people from ethnic minority groups, and particularly black students, are more likely than white people to return to higher education (Modood, 1997; HEFCE, 2010). This suggests a greater need for adult advice and guidance amongst ethnic minority groups and, possibly, yet more so for mothers.

Employer support

Employers', and, notably, line managers' support can be a key factor in progression and in movement up from low-paid jobs and out of poverty (Hudson, *et al.*, 2013). Encouraging learning, identifying opportunities and assisting personal development are important. However, equally, Hudson, *et al.* (2013) found that managers' unofficial practices could disadvantage people from ethnic minority groups.

Individual respondents who received employer support for development tended to see their careers improve. Employers seemed to provide the advice, as well as support for training, that ensured development activities were effective. Whilst it is possible that the relative success of those reporting employer support may also have been due to employers supporting those who were likely to achieve, it is likely that both factors are present. Schemes to encourage this form of support could be very useful and provide highly directed careers guidance and assistance.

Social segregation

Employment achievement may be hampered by social segregation, whether of the community or other groups. Networking was important for identifying specific and longer-term opportunities. This will be more circumscribed the narrower the experience of those networks.

Racism

Racism was perceived in employment and was believed to persist, albeit possibly in more subtle forms, reducing employment opportunities and success. Amongst stakeholders, most concern seemed to be expressed about the public sector. Whether or not racism is greater in the public sector, some of the concern stemmed from the importance of a small number of large public sector employers in an area and the perceived difference between race equality policies and perceived outcomes. To verify the race equality performance of the major public sector employers in the study areas was beyond the remit of this study, but would be useful and, with the co-operation of the organisations, should not be difficult.

Other barriers

A number of other barriers were apparent and have arisen in other studies previously: confidence and ability to deal with a criminal record; literacy

issues; and, for migrants, language, accent and recognition of foreign qualifications.

The role of place

As has been described in Chapter 2, for each of the three ethnic groups, employment patterns differed between Luton and Leicester,[16] despite overall demand being similar in these two places. African Caribbeans and Indians were more likely to be unemployed in Leicester than in Luton. This applied equally to women and men. Pakistanis had the opposite pattern, performing better in Leicester than Luton. Moreover, compared with Luton, Indian women in Leicester were almost twice as likely to have never worked, whereas the pattern was reversed for Pakistani women, with almost 50 per cent more Pakistani women in Luton, compared with Leicester, having never worked.

The research identified segregation as a factor contributing to employment performance, limiting the effectiveness of social networks and reinforcing cultural norms of women's role as nurturer rather than as breadwinner for some of the ethnic groups. The extent to which this contributed to the employment patterns described above is unclear, in part because the published data on residential segregation groups all Asians together and so residential segregation for Indians and Pakistanis cannot be identified. For Asians in aggregate, segregation was higher in Leicester than Luton (see above). Given the dominance of Indians amongst Asians in Leicester, it seems likely that, for Indians, segregation in Leicester may be higher than in Luton. This may contribute to the worse employment performance of Indians in Leicester compared with Luton and to Indian women's lower lifetime participation rate in Leicester than Luton. How segregation for Pakistanis differs between Leicester and Luton cannot be estimated from the data. However, for Pakistanis, self-employment is higher in Luton than Leicester. Given that self-employment in the Pakistani community appeared to reinforce segregation, this may be part of the reason for worse Pakistani labour market performance in Luton than in Leicester and a higher proportion of Pakistani women having never worked in Luton than in Leicester. It would be useful to examine segregation and employment performance for each Asian group separately using the 2011 Census to explore these issues more robustly.

The influence of London on labour market performance for people from ethnic minority groups in Luton was identified as important, with London offering a less racialised labour market environment and workplaces. Whilst it is understandable that employment in London may be less racialised, it is less clear why this should not also be the case for Luton, since 45 per cent of the population in Luton are from black and minority ethnic communities (see Table 5). In the study, the issue was reported by African Caribbeans in Luton only. It may be that this issue is more common for some groups (or for some groups in some areas) only. If so, it may also mean that the relative size of those ethnic groups is also important, and African Caribbeans comprise only 4 per cent of the population in Luton.

Finally, for any ethnic group, differences in labour market performance by place may be partly due to the extent to which migration is continuing, renewing the numbers unfamiliar with the labour market.

5 ADULT EDUCATION AND TRAINING

In the previous chapter, the role of a return to education, particularly higher education, in career change was identified. Participation in adult education and training amongst our respondents was much wider than this.

Most respondents had had some form of education or training after they had left full-time continuous education. This included participating in basic skills courses and short, vocational courses, as well as gaining major vocational and educational qualifications, including degrees. Motivations were varied and, although not all education and training was taken for career purposes nor was always likely to enhance employment prospects, there was a strongly held belief in the value of education and training for career enhancement.

Experience of later education and training

Basic skills

Basic skills training was undertaken by migrants to improve their English and by non-migrants to improve literacy and numeracy. Whilst the impact of basic skills training in adulthood on employment is unclear (Vignoles, 2009; Metcalf and Meadows, 2008), our research suggests that participation in basic skills training can be beneficial in prompting people to undertake more advanced courses. In our sample, the individuals who undertook basic skills training progressed to higher-level courses. For example, a migrant progressed from English language training, through other courses to a degree; a non-migrant progressed from literacy and numeracy training to a childcare course. The basic skills courses seemed crucial to career advancement.

Vocational training

Participation in adult learning amongst ethnic minority groups is high. In 2011/12, 20 per cent of adult learners in England were from ethnic minority groups, higher than the proportion in the population in England

(Skills Funding Agency, 2013). Respondents in the present study generally undertook vocational training for progression in their current career or business or as a tool for changing careers. Courses undertaken were at all levels and periods.

Whilst a relatively high proportion of people from ethnic minority groups participate in workplace learning, non-white people are less likely to enter 'high status' workplace training programmes such as apprenticeships (Skills Funding Agency, 2013; Owen, *et al.*, 2000). For some of the respondents, the vocational training was closely linked to their job or profession. These included employer-supported courses (e.g. a care worker did an HNC in social care), and standard professional courses either to expand skills (e.g. taken by a pharmacist) or to gain certification (e.g. by a teacher whose Pakistani qualification was not recognised in the UK). In all these types of cases, the training appeared to assist in career progression.

Where training was undertaken to change career, the impact was less certain. This could be because the training was not appropriate or because opportunities to use the skills did not occur. However, others successfully used it to make career changes.

Higher education

People from ethnic minority groups are more likely than the white population to return to university as mature students (Modood, 1997). This is particularly the case for black students, who are significantly more likely to enter university as mature students than students from other ethnic groups (HEFCE, 2010). Some respondents in the present study returned to education and gained a degree. For some of these, it appeared that they had not previously progressed from school to university due to lack of encouragement, advice and knowledge of education, and to racism. Gaining a degree had enabled some to move from low-paid employment into much better-paid jobs and careers.

Entry routes varied: some progressed through lower-level courses to a degree, whether or not their initial aim was a degree. Others had adequate entry qualifications from their schooling. Some studied for degrees full-time or part-time, the latter combining study with paid employment or childcare.

Higher education was pursued for career reasons, either to progress or to change career, or out of interest. Encouragement from employers may have been key, even where the return was not career related. Employers also provided useful careers guidance and information about appropriate courses. Migrants often returned to education because of lack of recognition of their existing degree or because they believed a British degree would prove more valuable. Others, in our cases all with pre-existing entry qualifications, were motivated by an interest in the degree subject. Having withdrawn from the labour market for maternity provided an impetus and time for study for some.

Unemployed people

Unemployment did not seem to be a prompt to returning to education and training. None of those who were unemployed at the time of interview had a history of adult education or training. They had neither received training at work, nor undertaken education or training themselves.

For those signing on, training and careers advice is liable to vary across localities, due to the extent and manner in which DWP unemployment programmes are subcontracted. For example, the Work Programme (the main DWP programme for unemployed people) is subcontracted to 18 different main providers across the country, each largely deciding their

own provision (see Meager, *et al.*, forthcoming; Newton, *et al.*, 2012). The Jobcentre did not appear to provide a general impetus for returning to education or training, although one respondent had been promised a referral to the National Careers Service, which had not, at the time of interview, materialised.

Serial course followers

A number of respondents had taken many vocational courses without any sign of educational progression or career relevance. These ranged from very short courses provided by voluntary organisations to diplomas.

For some, it was clear that they enjoyed studying, although training for career purposes was not required. For example, a Pakistani man in Glasgow had taken numerous vocational courses, including a diploma in interpreting and a diploma in public services. These were neither essential for his employment nor particularly aimed at his career: having already done a degree as an adult and gained a good job, he also received employer-supported training (e.g. for an NVQ in management).

Others, currently economically inactive, said the courses were for employment aims, but they had had no effect on their employment. For example, a woman who said she wanted to return to work after looking after her children full-time, wanted to work in childcare. She did a childcare course, but did not pursue the next level due to family reasons. This was followed by a short course (at a community centre) on digital image making. In these types of cases, it was unclear whether support was needed to encourage and guide the person in effective training and education or whether employment was not the real goal. A stakeholder described how, for some, gathering certificates seemed to be an end in itself.

Other studies do not seem to have investigated serial course following. It would be useful to know more about its prevalence and effect.

Employment impacts

Amongst those who had pursued education and training as adults, there seemed to be a strong belief in its importance for employment. It certainly appeared to have assisted progression for some. However, it was clear that this had not been the case for all the adult education and training. A prerequisite for success seemed to be pursuing standard, recognised progression routes and ensuring basic skills were adequate.

Employer-supported or encouraged training seemed to ensure appropriateness and contribute to progression. For professionals, the training required is often apparent. However, there was a problem for others. All those going to college or university, who had not been encouraged by their employer, said they had received no advice and guidance and had to find out about courses themselves. Their only information was about the course, which they got from the college itself. This was focussed on details of the course and how to apply, not whether the course fitted their aims. None said they could get advice from family and friends and some said that these knew nothing about the system. As a result, some individuals took qualifications which they never used. The problem seemed to be greatest for immigrants, but it was also severe for others wanting to pursue vocational courses.

The exception to this was in Leicester, where respondents received advice and guidance from a local community centre (Highfields Centre). In one case, an East African Asian woman with basic skills qualifications was

All those going to college or university, who had not been encouraged by their employer, said they had received no advice and guidance and had to find out about courses themselves.

encouraged (she said 'inspired') to pursue her interest in childcare by taking a Level 1 and 2 course in childcare. She planned to do a Level 3 qualification with the aim of working in a nursery. In another case, the individual received guidance and support, which eventually led him to gain a postgraduate qualification. This contact with the community centre marked a turning point in the individual's life as he had left school after GSCEs and had since been doing casual work without a great deal of direction in his life.

Key points

There was substantial involvement in adult education and training amongst the individuals participating in the study. This, variously, addressed previous underachievement in schooling and continuous education (for example, degrees and basic skills training), in-work skills and qualification requirements (for example, NVQ in teaching support management), career change and return to the labour market.

The effectiveness of the various types of training varied. Participation in courses for a qualification necessary for an occupation seemed to be effective in career change, although the long-term effects were less clear, owing to some making multiple career changes. This refers back to the issue raised in the previous section of the importance of good careers advice and guidance. Those who gained a degree seemed to do well, although the direction of causality was unclear (those who achieved a degree as mature students may have had the attributes to do well in the labour market anyway). Participation in short courses did not always lead to employment impacts. Education and training supported or encouraged by one's employer seemed to contribute to improved employment outcomes.

Guidance and advice, other than where forthcoming from one's employer or colleagues, seemed, in the main, to be rudimentary and reliant on course providers. However, it was apparent from the one example found in our areas (a community centre in Leicester), that the provision of guidance and advice could be extremely effective. Better careers advice, both to improve career choice and also to identify the usefulness of specific training and education, may reduce multiple involvement in training.

For women, time out to bring up children could be seen as providing the opportunity to return to education. Unemployment did not seem to have the same effect and, in our small sample, unemployed people (perhaps most in need of skills development) did not take part in adult education and training. This may have been due to cost, which had inhibited some participants' education and training, but may also have been due to motivation or, maybe, the emphasis on job seeking to maintain eligibility for benefits.

The role of place

The evidence gathered in the study points to a number of ways in which place may have a role in affecting the need for continued adult education, its availability and its effectiveness for improving labour market performance.

Differences in need may arise from differences in schooling leading to underachievement in earlier education and from differences in careers support leading to the need for career change in later life, as discussed in Chapter 3. Differences in continuing migration between areas will also lead to differences in need.

Obviously, educational and training provision and their cost to the user will vary by area. Employer training varies by industry as well as varying across individual employers. State provision varies with local authority

policies (affecting further and continuing education). Higher education is affected by national policy, as well as policies of individual institutions. Provision for unemployed people varies due to the widespread use of subcontracting.

Guidance and advice are important to the effectiveness of provision and will also vary locally. This particularly arose in the study in relation to voluntary sector provision tailored to specific ethnic groups, a form of provision seen to be useful to some ethnic groups and sub-groups (e.g. women). Such provision was reported to have declined due to public sector cuts in funding. Although this issue was raised in each area, the continuance of provision may vary with place, due particularly to local authority policy or differences in access to other streams of funding.

6 VOLUNTEERING

Volunteering may assist employment in a number of ways: through providing skills (both generic and job specific), building a CV, helping individuals to identify career options and building networks. People may also move from voluntary to paid work within an organisation, either through funding being developed around the individual or through volunteers being in a good position to take advantage of vacancies.

The impact of volunteering on employability is thought to be dependent on a range of factors including age, gender and the frequency of volunteering (Kamerāde, 2013; Strauß, 2008). Hirst (2001) argues that volunteering can also have a negative effect on re-employment for some people, but suggests that the effect of volunteering on re-employment may be more positive for unemployed people from ethnic minority backgrounds. Whilst volunteering may not have immediate labour market effects for many unemployed people, Hirst suggests that it can nevertheless be beneficial to an individual's employability in the long run by virtue of increasing people's aspirations to find a 'good' job.

People from ethnic minority groups in England are on the whole less likely to take part in formal volunteering than the white majority. Data from the 2009/10 Citizenship Survey estimated that in England 26 per cent of the Pakistani population took part in formal volunteering, compared with 32 per cent of the Indian, 38 per cent of the Caribbean, and 41 per cent of the white population. However, data from Glasgow and Clyde NHS suggests that the ethnic minority population in Glasgow are more likely to volunteer than their white counterparts (Heim and MacAskill, 2006). This, however, is in comparison to low numbers of volunteers amongst the general population in Glasgow (8 per cent).

The role of volunteering for the ethnic groups in our case study areas was examined with stakeholders, individuals and employers.

Employers' views of volunteering

Employers in the study, even in relation to the same jobs, differed in their response to volunteering. Some regarded volunteering as irrelevant, either wanting paid employment experience (believing volunteering could not demonstrate the skills or attributes sought) or being unconcerned about experience. Others did see volunteering as relevant in their assessment of job applicants, but the volunteering had to be seen as formal (for example, voluntary work in a hospice, rather than providing care to a disabled relative) or highly relevant to the job, i.e. indicating specific skills. However, some did see volunteering as indicative of more generic skills and outlook and so the specific type of volunteering was less important to them. This range of responses to volunteering is important, because it suggests that, whilst volunteering may enhance a CV, its effectiveness is diminished in comparison with paid employment because of its acceptability to only some employers.

Involvement in volunteering

Amongst our respondents, volunteering was common. Voluntary activities included those connected with the individual's community or faith, with ethnic minorities in general, or were more generic e.g. classroom assistant.

Voluntary activities were undertaken for both work and non-work reasons. Work-related volunteering took two forms: volunteering in expectation of a job in the organisation in which the person volunteered or gaining experience to compensate for lack of work experience. Some volunteered in charities in which they had previously been clients.

Some respondents were highly active in a range of volunteering, both inside and outside their community. These individuals seemed very dynamic and had good networking skills. They had either been successful in their careers or, in the case of a mother wanting to return to work, likely to succeed in the future. It was difficult to judge the extent to which volunteering had developed their networking skills and dynamism or whether these were already present, leading to the wide-ranging volunteering.

Volunteering can encompass a variety of forms, and can be conceptualised in different ways by different ethnic minority groups (Gaskin, 2003). Previous research suggests that some ethnic groups do not regard their voluntary activities strictly as 'voluntary work', viewing this label as too formal (Kamat, 2001). Stakeholders suggested that formal voluntary work was rare in the Pakistani community (which is borne out by the figures above) but, at the same time, said that it was common for people to provide assistance in connection with the mosque or with Pakistani community-based groups. This was described as part of their faith and not seen as volunteering. Mosque or community voluntary activities might include, for example, catering for large numbers, befriending, assisting older people and managing the mosque. Where activities were seen as part of their faith, stakeholders suggested they were likely to be overlooked in terms of providing evidence of skills to employers. Despite the relatively low percentage of Indians volunteering (see the Citizenship Survey data above), neither discussions with stakeholders nor with individual respondents provided evidence of the reasons for this.

Impact of volunteering

As noted above, the impact that volunteering has on employability can be dependent on a number of factors. Volunteering had been very useful to some of our respondents, notably the late achievers, for gaining employment and career development.

Examples were found where volunteering for employment reasons had resulted in job opportunities. For example, an individual with no qualifications on leaving school had wanted to work in childcare. She had volunteered for a childcare charity for a few hours a week. This had led to some paid work and then into full-time paid employment with the charity, including progression into management. Another example was of a man who had volunteered with a charity to gain work experience more generally but had progressed within the organisation to become its director.

Even where volunteering was not undertaken for employment reasons, it could provide paid employment, affect employment aspirations and increase employability (e.g. by enhancing a CV). For example, a woman started volunteering with young people when she was a teenager. Later, as part of a series of catering jobs, she worked as a cook in a youth organisation. She started to volunteer at the organisation, which led to her becoming a Community Development Worker at a youth advice centre and a career in the children and youth sector, culminating with managing a Sure Start centre and becoming a self-employed consultant. In another case, a woman who had left the labour market on marriage had volunteered as a classroom assistant. This had led to an interest in seeking paid employment in this role. The same woman had volunteered on an ethnic minority project for a museum. She then received payment for some subsequent, but short-term, work. In another case, a childcare manager had taken time out of the labour market for personal reasons and had been setting up childcare training on a voluntary basis. This was likely to assist her in her longer-term aim of becoming an early years lecturer.

Being a client of a voluntary organisation could also result in volunteering and progression, as was the case for a former drug user. He was helped out of drug use by a drug rehabilitation project, in which he started to volunteer. He undertook various types of training, including a degree, and was at the time of interview trying to set up his own drug and alcohol service charity.

Key points

The evidence shows that volunteering can enhance employability and raise aspirations, enabling movement to better-paid jobs from unemployment or low-paid jobs. The effectiveness of volunteering seemed to be greater for those tailoring the type of volunteering to their employment aims. Three issues arose in the study in relation to volunteering: the variation in volunteering by ethnicity; variation in the usefulness of the voluntary activity for employment; and variation in whether volunteering is used on CVs.

Compared with the ethnic majority, people from ethnic minorities are reported to participate less in voluntary work. Reported participation is particularly low for Pakistanis and, to a lesser degree, Indians. Although there were suggestions that this difference was cultural, it also appeared that, certainly for Pakistanis and Indian Muslims, the difference may partly be due to social support activities related to the mosque not being regarded as voluntary work by the volunteers. The same may apply to social support provided in other religious contexts (e.g. by Hindus and Sikhs).

> Volunteering had been very useful to some of our respondents, notably the late achievers, for gaining employment and career development.

These activities may be less effective for individuals trying to develop their employment in new directions, but they could be of use on CVs.

It appeared there was a need to improve awareness of how volunteering might be used to enhance employment and help move to higher-paid jobs from unemployment or low-paid jobs. This seemed to apply particularly to Pakistanis, but also, perhaps, to Indians.

The role of place

Whilst place might affect volunteering opportunities, the main issue which arose in the study in relation to place was how networking was important for identifying and gaining access to the most effective volunteering activities. As has been discussed in previous chapters, such networking may be curtailed with higher degrees of social segregation, and this may vary by place.

7 CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

Poverty rates amongst people from ethnic minority groups are high and vary across the country. As part of the development of its programme of research into ethnicity and poverty, JRF commissioned a scoping review of ethnicity, poverty and place.

The review argued that consideration of place is important as it enables analysis to move beyond considering vulnerability to poverty as something necessarily arising from ethnicity or culture alone (Garner and Bhattacharyya, 2011). It set out that a focus on 'place' offers a means of assessing the resources available to (and barriers acting against) people in different ethnic groups in particular areas, and thus of the factors which impact on the circumstances in which people live and the choices open to them. The places in which people live and work have a significant effect on their lives, in particular through the influences location has on access to labour markets, services and social networks.

This study has sought to add to our understanding of why poverty rates for people of any ethnic group vary by location through examining factors affecting variation in labour market performance. The study has drawn on previous research and case studies of people from three ethnic minority groups (African Caribbeans, East African Asian and Pakistanis) in three locations (Glasgow, Leicester and Luton) to identify how local opportunities, structures and policies affect labour market performance. Of particular interest was how local state provision (e.g. education, careers advice), treatment in the labour market, racism and discrimination interacted with individual and community resources to affect labour market performance.

The study's approach was to examine individuals' educational and employment histories to identify how these had been affected by local circumstances, e.g. educational provision and career support. This was complemented by published local labour market data, evidence from previous research and stakeholders' and employers' evidence on the locality to further understand the local context.

This chapter brings together our findings on the role of place. The chapter also discusses the implications for local organisations to improve

labour market performance and hence reduce poverty amongst people from ethnic minority groups.

Labour market performance, ethnicity and place

The following discusses the factors which were identified as leading to variation in labour market performance across places for a given ethnic group. These differences depend, in part, on racism and discrimination (both direct and indirect), with local policies and structures not offering adequate provision for people from ethnic minority groups. They also depend on variations in the ethnic group between places. Thus, for example, performance will vary with the proportion of migrants comprising the ethnic group in different localities and how local services address this.

Economic opportunities and settlement patterns

Previous research had identified how settlement patterns, with ethnic minorities geographically clustered, combined with differing economic fortunes in these areas, had affected ethnic minority performance. All three of the case study areas had experienced major economic changes in the second half of the 20th century, resulting in the loss of employment (including whole industries) in work in which people from ethnic minority groups were concentrated. Gender effects were also apparent, particularly in Leicester, where job loss in the hosiery industry affected women in particular, and in Luton, where the decline in the car industry affected men. The decline of the hosiery industry in Leicester may have been a major reason for the low lifetime participation rate of Indian women in Leicester. Hosiery had provided employment for many Indian women, including migrants who could not speak English. Because of language difficulties, the latter found it difficult to find new jobs. The effect should have declined with the growth of British-born generations.

People from ethnic minority groups are concentrated in more deprived areas. This is likely to reduce employment opportunities (particularly for women, who tend to need shorter travel to work journeys), although such effects were not generally identified by the study. The exception was a constraint on public transport, creating a barrier to working outside standard daytime hours. This type of constraint will vary with place.

Cultural factors

Cultural differences exist between ethnic groups. These were identified as leading to differences in labour market aspirations and support networks. The first of these is discussed in this section; the second in the following section, which focusses on social networks.

For men, the study did not identify differences in aspirations and measures of success affecting labour market performance. However, there were major differences for women, depending on the emphasis on the role of women as family nurturers and as breadwinners. The emphasis on the nurturing role was particularly strong for Pakistani women. It seemed slightly weaker for Indian/East African Asian women and was weakest for African Caribbean women. A strong emphasis on nurturing led to more women never having a paid job or lengthy (or permanent) withdrawal from the labour market for childcare and other family care, which greatly reduced occupational levels and earnings. The study also found that a strong emphasis on nurturing affected educational achievement for girls, reducing the incentive to continue in education. The consequences were lower

participation and success in the labour market, reducing family incomes and increasing poverty.

At the same time, variation in Pakistani and Indian women's participation rates between localities with similar economic conditions suggests these cultural preferences either interact with local circumstances, resulting in differing labour market outcomes, or differ between localities, perhaps evolving over time. This evolution may be affected by location, by the mix of ethnicities, by the extent of continuing migration, the degree of segregation, and state and community policies and provision. The evidence led us to conclude, tentatively, that social segregation might influence cultural preferences, with lower levels of social segregation leading to higher rates of participation for women. (However, the direction of causality may be the opposite: social segregation is lower because cultural difference is less.) It would be useful to assess the link between segregation and employment performance more robustly using the 2011 Census.

Culture also influenced the acceptability of certain occupations for women. For Pakistani women, this appeared to reduce career opportunities and encourage entry to lower-paid occupations.

The interplay between culture and women's labour market success raises major issues for addressing poverty. Government policies, including taxation and benefit policies, encourage employment for all adults in a family. These have an in-built bias against ethnic groups with a culture stressing the role of nurturing, for example, that of Pakistanis. This is liable to lead to stress for such groups and will lead to greater poverty.

Human capital: qualifications, skills and knowledge of the labour market

Human capital is a key factor in labour market success: the acquisition of qualifications, development of skills and knowledge to navigate the labour market are essential to avoid unemployment and poorly paid jobs. The study found that development of capital was affected by ethnicity and place. The education and training system and careers support vary by place and this leads to variation in the acquisition of human capital and subsequent labour market success. This pattern is common to all ethnic groups. However, for people from ethnic minority groups, racism and discrimination within the system erect additional barriers. Moreover, ethnic minorities are at a disadvantage in addressing the deficits informally: family and peers are very important in providing information, developing aspirations and supporting career development. But their usefulness is class biased: if peers and family are in low-level jobs, they are less likely to have the knowledge to provide assistance with entry to higher-level careers. Given the concentration of people from ethnic minority groups in lower-level careers, this creates a vicious circle across generations. For migrants, including those who have been in Britain for a lengthy period, the barriers to acquiring human capital and passing it to one's children are yet higher. It is particularly this interplay between the inadequacies in the formal system combined with some disadvantages in the informal system used to address these deficits that means differences will arise by place. Ability to negotiate the education and labour market systems was crucial, affecting acquisition of qualifications and the ability to gain and progress in employment. Where the system did not accord equal access, some ethnic groups performed worse than others.

Educational capital and qualifications
There is evidence of racism continuing in the education system (in schools and higher-level institutions), reducing aspirations and achievement.

Additional difficulties were identified for migrants, who were less familiar with the system. This resulted in parents being less able to influence their children's schooling and provide support. Migrant children need to be given support to overcome the disruption to schooling of migration. Other difficulties arise when foreign qualifications are not recognised.

Knowledge of careers and the labour market
Good, formal careers support (to develop aspirations and to mark out the routes to achieve careers goals) is vital to address the occupational and educational bias in informal support: informal support replicates the background of those providing it. Thus good formal support is particularly important for people from ethnic minority groups, who are concentrated in lower-level occupations. Recent national policy changes are likely to reduce the effectiveness of formal support.

For adults returning to education or changing careers, deciding career aims and making the appropriate choices over courses, institutions and modes is very difficult. Sources of good, independent advice are lacking, and potential students may not have informal sources to fall back on. Given the higher rates of return to education amongst some ethnic minority groups, this disproportionately disadvantages ethnic minorities.

Support to improve access to employment and employability is important. However, the only issue identified in the study where this appeared to have an ethnic or place link, was volunteering as a labour market tool. Volunteering was identified as a route into decent work. It is particularly relevant to people from ethnic minority groups who have higher rates of unemployment and therefore less employment experience. It appeared as though ethnic groups defined voluntary work differently, resulting in the potential of volunteering for labour market improvement being overlooked.

Social networks
Social networks can be an important source of educational, career and labour market information, knowledge and contacts and can help overcome deficits in the formal system. However, networks tend to replicate one's class (or one's parents' class) position. This was apparent in the study, with upper-middle-class children receiving knowledge from parents and peers to assist them to achieve better qualifications and careers, which was not forthcoming for other children.

Whilst class was probably the most important restriction on networks, given ethnic minority groups' higher levels of unemployment and lesser career success, ethnically segregated social networks may more often be less useful for moving out of unemployment or lower-paid jobs. Indeed, in the study, community-based and family-based networks seemed to reduce the resources to negotiate the wider labour market. Small business-based networks (except for those who wished to enter self-employment) seemed to have a similar effect.

Socially segregated networks exist throughout society, based on various factors (for example, class, age), bringing people together with similar interests and providing support networks. For people from ethnic minority groups, it may also be a defensive response to racism. It is a traditional form of support for migrants, particularly for those for those with poor English. Thus, the issue for the study was not the existence of segregated social networks, but whether these varied by place or whether factors differed by place to ameliorate their negative effects. Certainly, residential segregation

Good, formal careers support (to develop aspirations and to mark out the routes to achieve careers goals) is vital to address the occupational and educational bias in informal support.

varied with place. Although this does not mean that social segregation must vary, it seems likely. The mix of migrants and non-migrants also varies by place, suggesting that socially segregated networks will, too.

Compared with other groups, Pakistani social networks seemed to be more focussed on the extended family or on other Pakistanis. This may have been encouraged by a greater involvement in self-employment restricting social interactions. The importance of this is discussed in the next section.

Employer support
The importance of employer support for progression, careers advice and training was highlighted in the report. This was forthcoming for some, but discrimination appeared to exclude others from this vital support.

Racism and discrimination
Racism was a recurring theme in the study, reducing employment opportunities and success and increasing poverty. Forms of racism identified included stereotyping of school children, discouragement of their achievement, discrimination in recruitment, exclusion from networks at work important for promotion, and rejection of individuals' knowledge and ideas. Most concern seemed to be expressed about the public sector. Whether or not racism is greater in the public sector, some of the concern stemmed from the importance of a small number of large public sector employers in an area and the perceived difference between race equality policies and perceived outcomes. Direct evidence of racism varying by place was provided by African Caribbeans in Luton, who commuted to London to avoid racism, which had hampered career progression.

Migration
Whilst many people from ethnic minority groups are British-born, migration, of both new and existing groups, continues. Whilst migrants' employment success may be influenced by a strong work ethic and determination, they and their children suffer multiple disadvantages. Their lack of knowledge of the educational and labour market systems reduces their ability to negotiate these or provide assistance to their children. Depending on age of migration, educational disruption and lack of recognition of qualifications can occur. For some, English language difficulties hamper employment. This leads to differences by place in employment success for a given ethnic group due to differences in the mix of British born and migrants and the extent to which support is provided to overcome these barriers.

Self-employment
The prevalence of self-employment varies across ethnic groups. Whilst familial self-employment can provide opportunities for employment, it also appears to limit alternatives. For children and young people, work in the family business may provide fewer credentials for future employment, compared with working as an employee; social networks appear to be particularly limited, resulting in less knowledge (amongst parents and children) about the labour market opportunities, career paths and successful approaches to gaining employment, thus diminishing labour market success. The prevalence of self-employment varies between localities (and as our comparison of Luton and Leicester showed, including in comparison with the area average). This seems likely to result in differences for each ethnic group in employment success and hence poverty.

Public sector issues

The above suggests various ways in which the state may contribute to continued disadvantage for people from ethnic minority groups in the labour market and hence their concentration in poverty. The study identified some factors which might be contributing to this.

The relative size of ethnic minority groups in the locality

There was some evidence to support the contention that people from small ethnic minority groups may be worse served by their local authority where other ethnic minority groups are much larger. In Leicester, discussion with stakeholders suggested that the high percentage of Indians in the local ethnic minority population meant that differing needs of other groups might be ignored or given less priority. As one stakeholder said:

"One of the difficulties with Leicester is that there's little differentiation with the Pakistani community and Asian community as a whole – they're seen as one Asian community. Pakistanis are subsumed into Indian/Asian – we don't distinguish."

– Stakeholder, Leicester

Stakeholders in Luton, where no ethnic minority group is as dominant, tended to specify ethnic minority groups more finely. Given the economic and cultural differences between groups, this could impact on the support provided and hence the labour market performance of people from minority ethnic groups.

Related to this was the extent to which the local council support decisions were influenced by lobbying. The effectiveness of community groups in lobbying varies. In addition, effectiveness may be influenced by the relative size of the minority group, with larger groups carrying more weight.

Aggregating similar groups in needs analyses (e.g. 'Asians'), focussing on developing support based on size of population and taking a reactive approach to policy development (e.g. responding to lobbying, rather than identifying needs), were approaches which risked overlooking small minority groups. To some extent this is understandable, as there are costs of encompassing smaller groups in policy development. The degree to which this is problematic depends on the extent of differences between the ethnic groups. However, it did seem that there were sometimes major gaps to be addressed. It is important that small ethnic minority groups do not fall off the radar and that needs assessments and policy impact analysis are conducted for small, as well as larger groups.

Discrimination-proofing policies

Whilst the public sector has had a duty to promote equality of opportunity (a duty which is being removed), this has not always resulted in lack of discrimination. The main issue reported by respondents in the study was in relation to public sector expenditure on regeneration.

Public sector expenditure on regeneration may have differential effects across ethnicities. Stakeholders described how they saw the criteria for expenditure across locations as being ethnically biased and resulting in areas of high ethnic minority population and deprivation not receiving funds. This applied, for example, to some European Social Fund expenditure. Given the concentration of people from ethnic minority groups in areas of high poverty, this is a particularly important issue to address.

A related issue was that, due to financial stringencies, local authorities had been cutting funding to some community-focussed organisations which provided important labour market support services. If the additional disadvantages people from ethnic minority groups face in the labour market are to be addressed, including through failure of services to address racism and particular needs, it is important that supplementary support services are available.

Public sector employers

Concern was expressed about discrimination in the public sector and under-representation of people from ethnic minority groups amongst public sector employees. The study was not able to check whether this was the case, but, under legislative requirements, the organisations themselves should be monitoring this issue and taking action if problems occur. However, it is important that this is both effective and seen to be effective by people from ethnic minority groups.

This may be a difficult issue to address and there could be a number of ways to do so, involving community groups, trade unions and employers.

Additional policy implications

The study has highlighted issues of long-standing concern and examined how these might be affected by place. To a large extent, racism is the underlying cause: racism affecting teachers' expectations of pupils and their treatment of them, and racism reducing employment and progression, concentrating people from ethnic minority groups in lower-paid jobs. This combines with class to make it more difficult for parents and others to assist young people from ethnic minority groups to move to better work. To remove the link between ethnicity and poverty, racism needs to be addressed. However, the study has not identified novel approaches to racism and so we confine ourselves to comments on some more discrete policies. These are in addition to those mentioned earlier in this chapter.

Working with people from ethnic minority communities

A strong message from the research was that policies and provision need to be developed by people from ethnic minority groups or with their involvement. This may be through community groups, employees or other consultation methods. Without such an approach, it is easy to ignore differences between ethnic groups and also to overlook how policies fail to provide equal support across ethnic groups.

This applies to all parts of the public sector (local authorities, educational institutions, the DWP/Jobcentre Plus, Local Enterprise Partnerships) and to employers.

Special mention should be made in relation to schools and working with parents, ensuring parents' equal participation across ethnic groups. International differences in education and cultural attitudes mean that parents from some groups are less aware of the need to interact with the school, resulting in less support. For some migrants this will be exacerbated by language difficulties. Educating parents and schools further about this would help, as would encouraging greater parental involvement in the schools. It was suggested that some community groups were well placed to provide outreach work, to draw parents into the schools and also to inform the schools.

Local authorities

The study suggested that small ethnic minority groups were being overlooked by some local authorities. A related issue is the patchiness of local authorities' monitoring of service recipients by ethnicity. It is important that local authorities have good knowledge of each of the ethnic minority groups in their authority and whether there are differences in needs for improving labour market outcomes. The 2011 Census provides basic quantitative data. However, this needs to be supplemented with knowledge of culture, experiences and needs to identify where local authority policies are failing to assist specific ethnic groups and to identify how provision might be improved. This might be done through working with community groups, trade unions and their own ethnic minority employees.

Improving knowledge of the labour market and educational systems

The report has identified variation in knowledge of the educational and labour market systems. This is related to class as much as ethnicity, although it is most severe for migrants. Lack of knowledge reduces employment performance and reinforces social immobility.

Schools, local authorities, careers service providers, the DWP (and their subcontractors) and other providers of employment and educational support need to recognise, take responsibility for and reduce variations in knowledge affecting the service received. Appropriate approaches may or may not be targeted at or tailored towards specific groups by ethnicity. However, it will be important to monitor by ethnicity how well key groups are served, particularly if the approach is not targeted.

Employers play a key role in providing careers guidance and directed training for some employees. Their support can be highly targeted to career development and tailored for the individual. Their involvement in mentoring schemes and in wider information schemes would be particularly useful.

Careers support

The report has highlighted how careers support is of particular importance for people from ethnic minority groups, if intergenerational cycles of poverty are to be broken. Independent adult guidance is of particular importance, given the disproportionate numbers who return to education. Provision by schools and for adults has been widely criticised. An expansion of formal careers support would be very useful to assist later career development and compensate for earlier disadvantage. In addition, support to develop improved networks, to expose people to wider career experiences, job contacts and support would be useful. This would be helpful for all, but, particularly, women, migrants and groups which tend to be more isolated. The purpose would be to expand knowledge and contacts outside one's everyday set of contacts and experience. Cross-ethnic exposure could be very important for some, as would exposure to people in better jobs. However, some groups may be harder to engage in cross-ethnic provision and so a specific group focus might be more effective. Networks need not be employment focussed. For example, in Glasgow, an Asian-wide radio station was reported as having brought people together from across Asian communities. Such measures need to be culturally sensitive to succeed. In particular, gender-segregated provision may be necessary to reach some groups. It is unclear how support can be improved at the moment, when financial stringencies are more likely to lead to cuts in careers services than in what may be seen as more core areas. At this stage, raising awareness of how careers support is not ethnic neutral and the link with poverty may be useful.

Volunteering

Volunteering was identified as a route into decent work and this could be further developed. It is particularly relevant to people from ethnic minority groups due to their higher rates of unemployment and so lesser employment experience. There seem to be a number of strands for this, with roles for different players: first, developing a greater awareness of how volunteering can assist and how to use the volunteering which already takes place; second, developing more volunteering opportunities, including those with a link to employment; and third, working with employers to increase recognition of volunteering as an indicator of job suitability (of specific and generic skills). The voluntary sector in general and community organisations, alongside employers, could have a role in this development.

Concluding remarks

Many of the themes identified in this study, in particular the difficulties faced by young people from disadvantaged backgrounds or in deprived areas, are relevant across the UK and to members of all ethnic groups, including the white majority. An implicit thread running through this is the intergenerational transmission of poor labour market performance and poverty, which people from ethnic minority groups are caught up in to a greater degree due to racism and discrimination. Education and careers support should break the intergenerational cycle. However, the UK's low level of social mobility demonstrates how these fail to so do.

Many of the issues are generic, reducing the employment chances of people from ethnic minority groups in all parts of the country. Indeed, with the exception of racism, many of the issues are common to people from the ethnic majority in lower classes. It seems to us important that generic social mobility policies are improved, but that these are developed with better understanding of variations by ethnicity and with proper monitoring to ensure all ethnic minority groups are fully supported.

This does not mean neither place nor ethnicity matters; as the study shows, context matters for how these difficulties manifest themselves for individuals and communities, and they are exacerbated by social segregation and lack of knowledge. This emphasises the need for both targeted interventions and mainstream services to become more effective, in part by addressing the specific needs of local communities.

NOTES

1   Nandy and Platt (2010) defined poverty as income below 60 per cent of median income, a commonly used definition. Poverty rates for Indians, Chinese, African Caribbeans and Black Africans ranged between 21 per cent and 24 per cent. For white British the rate was 16 per cent. Estimates used the Family Resources Survey and Households Below Average Income 2003/04–2007/08.

2   Census 2001.

3   Factors affecting outcomes are discussed in more detail in labour market outcomes, deprivation and place below.

4   Note that the local authority areas are not discrete labour markets (travel to work areas, TTWAs). For these three locations the TTWAs would have been larger and so required information on additional local authorities' approaches. Given the nature of the study, we could see no benefit in extending the research to a wider area.

5   Data sources for England and for Scotland differ and so comparable data for Glasgow, Leicester and Luton was not always available. In particular, relevant Census data for 2011 was only available for England at the time of the study. Rather than use data more than 12 years old, this has meant we have been unable to examine employment patterns by ethnicity in Glasgow.

6   The criteria for defining the number of groups are not specified. They classify Leicester as having a single minority group, but being an exception to people from ethnic minorities being concentrated in the local areas of most extreme poverty.

7   Strictly, one of the few with a high ethnic minority population: the study only covered cities where more than 6 per cent of the population were from ethnic minority groups.

8   Asians comprised 17 per cent of the population in the 10 per cent most deprived neighbourhoods, compared with 23 per cent of the population elsewhere; for blacks, the figures were 5.2 per cent and 1.7 per cent, respectively (ODPM, 2006).

9   At the time of the study, Census 2011 data of economic activity by ethnicity for Glasgow was unavailable.

10 This also holds, although less strongly, if students are excluded (i.e. if the denominator excludes students).

11 This also holds, although less strongly, if students are excluded (i.e. the denominator excludes students).

12 Once students are excluded the gap for both becomes wider.

13 Once students are excluded there is little difference in the economic activity rate of Pakistani men between Luton and Leicester.

14 None of the African Caribbeans within the individual sample came from families with their own business, closing the possibility of moving into a family business or informal learning about business.

15 Burgess, *et al.* (2008) examined the link between school and local area segregation and school attainment. They found no link. However, their measures of segregation (school, local authority and Travel to Work Area) are at a wider level than the social networks being discussed here.

16 Census data was not available at the time of the study for Glasgow.

REFERENCES

Ackers, L. and Stalford, H. (2004) *A community for children?: Children, citizenship and migration in the European Union*. Aldershot: Ashgate

Bagguley, P. and Hussain, Y. (2007) *The role of higher education in providing opportunities for South Asian women*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at: http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/1997-education-ethnicity-poverty.pdf

Battu, H., Seaman, P, and Zenou, Y. (2011) 'Job contact networks and the ethnic minorities', *Labour Economics*, 18(1), pp. 48–56

Berthoud, R. (2000) 'Ethnic employment penalties in Britain', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 26(3), pp. 389–416

Burgess, S., Wilson, D., Briggs, A. and Piebalga, A. (2008) 'Segregation and the Attainment of Minority Ethnic Pupils in England', Working Paper No. 08/204, Centre for Market and Public Organisation, Bristol Institute of Public Affairs, University of Bristol. Available at: http://www.bristol.ac.uk/cmpo/publications/papers/2008/wp204.pdf

Campaign to End Child Poverty (2013) *The child poverty map of the UK 2013*. Available at: http://www.endchildpoverty.org.uk/images/ecp/130212%20ECP%20local%20report%20final(2).pdf

Campbell, T. (2013) *Stereotyped at seven?: Biases in teacher judgements of pupils' ability and attainment*. CLS Working Paper 2013/8. London: Institute of Education

Carter-Wall, C. and Whitfield, G. (2012) *The role of aspirations, attitudes and behaviour in closing the educational attainment gap*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Cassen, R. and Kingdon, G. (2007) *Tackling low educational achievement*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Cassidy, C., O'Connor, R. and Dorrer, N. (2006) *Young people's experiences of transition to adulthood: A study of minority ethnic and white young people*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Cherti, M. and Bradley, L. (2011) *Inside Madrassas. Understanding And Engaging With British-Muslim Faith Supplementary Schools*. London: IPPR. Available at: http://www.ippr.org/images/media/files/publication/2011/11/inside-madrassas_Nov2011_8301.pdf

Clark, K. and Drinkwater, S. (2007) *Ethnic Minorities in the Labour Market: Dynamics and Diversity*. Bristol: Policy Press/Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Department for Communities and Local Government (2010) *Citizenship Survey: 2009–10 (April 2009–March 2010), England*. Statistical Release 12, July 2010. London: Department for Communities and Local Government. Available at: http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20120919132719/http:/www.communities.gov.uk/documents/statistics/pdf/164191.pdf

Dex, S. and Ward, K. (2007) *Parental care and employment in early childhood: Analysis of the Millennium Cohort Study (MCS) Sweeps 1 and 2*. Working Paper Series No. 57. Manchester: Equal Opportunities Commission

Garner, S. and Bhattacharyya, G. (2011) *Poverty, ethnicity and place*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at: http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/poverty-ethnicity-place-full.pdf

Gaskin, K. (2003) *Joining forces: The black and minority ethnic twinning initiative: Evaluation and good practice*. Home Office Research Study 256. London: Home Office

Gillborn, D. (2008) 'Coincidence or conspiracy? Whiteness, policy and the persistence of the Black/White achievement gap', *Educational Review*, 60(3), pp. 229–48

Glasgow City Council (2012) *People and Households in Glasgow. A Comparison of Demographic Change in Glasgow's Deprived Areas and the Rest of the City in 2001–2010*. Briefing Paper by Director of Development and Regeneration Services. Available at: http://www.glasgow.gov.uk/CHttpHandler.ashx?id=8548&p=0

Glasgow City Council (2012b) *Population and Households by Ethnicity in Glasgow. Estimates of Change 2001–2010*. Briefing Paper by Director of Development and Regeneration Services. Available at: http://www.glasgow.gov.uk/CHttpHandler.ashx?id=5705&p=0

Gloster, R., Pollard, E., Bertram, C., Williams, J., Hirsh, W., Buzzeo, J. and Henderson, J. (2013) *Adult career decision-making; Qualitative research*. Research Paper 132. London: Department for Business, Innovation and Skills

Heath, A. and Cheung, S. Y. (2006) *Ethnic penalties in the labour market: Employers and discrimination*. Department for Work and Pensions Research Report No. 341. London: DWP

Heath, A. and McMahon, D. (1997) 'Education and occupational attainments: The impact of ethnic origins', in Karn, V. (ed) *Ethnicity in the 1991 Census, Volume Four: Employment, education and housing among the ethnic minority populations of Britain*. London: Office for National Statistics

HEFCE (2010) *Student ethnicity: Profile and progression of entrants to full-time, first degree study*. Bristol: HEFCE

Heim, D. and MacAskill, S. (2006) *Black and minority ethnic health in Greater Glasgow: A comparative report on the health and well-being of African & Caribbean, Chinese, Indian and Pakistani people and the general population*. Glasgow: Greater Glasgow NHS Board

Hirst, A. (2001) *Links between volunteering and employability*. London: Department for Education and Skills

Hooley, T., Marriott, J. and Sampson, J. P. Jr (2011) *Fostering college and career readiness: How career development activities in schools impact on graduation rates and students' life success*. iCeGS Occasional Paper. Derby: University of Derby

Hudson, M., Netto, G., Sosenko, F., Noon, M., de Lima, P., Gilchrist, A. and Kamenou-Aigbekaen, N. (2013) *In-work poverty, ethnicity and workplace cultures*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at: http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/poverty-ethnicity-workplace-culture-full.pdf

Hutchinson, J., Rolfe, H., Moore, N., Bysshe, S. and Bentley, K. (2011) *All things being equal? Equality and diversity in careers education, information, advice and guidance*. Equality and Human Rights Commission Research Report 71. Manchester: Equality and Human Rights Commission

Kamat, A. (2001) *Room for growth: Patterns and potential in black and minority ethnic volunteering*. London: Community Development Foundation in association with the Black Development Agency

Kamerāde, D. (2013) 'Volunteering during unemployment: More skills but where is the job?' Paper presented at 19th Annual Voluntary Sector and Volunteering Research Conference, Sheffield Hallam University, Sheffield, 11 September 2013. Available at: http://blogs.ncvo.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/guest/volunteering_during_unemployment_kamerade.pdf

Kenway, P. and Palmer, G. (2007) *Poverty among ethnic groups: how and why does it differ?* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Kintrea, K., St Clair, R. and Houston, M. (2011) *The influence of parents, places and poverty on educational attitudes and aspirations*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/young-people-education-attitudes-full.pdf

Leicester City Council (2008) *The Diversity of Leicester. A Demographic Profile*. Leicester: Leicester City Council

Leicester City Council (2010) *Understanding Leicester: ethnic diversity, young people and deprivation*. Research and Intelligence Team, Chief Executive's Office, November 2010

Leicester City Council (2011) *The Diversity of Leicester: Summary of Key Facts: 2011*. Leicester: Leicester City Council

Longhi, S. and Platt, L. (2008) *Pay Gaps Across Equality Areas*. Equality and Human Rights Commission Research Report No. 9. Manchester: EHRC

Luton Borough Council (2013) *Research and Geospatial Information.* Available at: http://www.luton. gov.uk

Mayhew, L. and Waples, S. (2011) *The growth and changing complexion of Luton's population. A structural analysis and decomposition.* Available at: http://www.luton.gov.uk/Environment/Lists/ LutonDocuments/PDF/Planning/Observatory/Growth%20of%20Luton%20Population.pdf

McCabe, A., Gilchrist, A., Harris, K., Afridi, A. and Kyprianou, P. (2013) *Making the links: Poverty, ethnicity and social networks.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Meager, N., Newton, B., Foley, B., Sainsbury, R., Corden, A., Irving, A., Lane, P. and Weston, K. (forthcoming, 2014) *Work Programme Evaluation: Interim synthesis report.* Department for Work and Pensions Research Report

Metcalf, H. (2009) *Pay gaps across the equality strands: a review.* Manchester: EHRC

Metcalf, H. and Meadows, P. (2008) 'Outcomes for basic skills learners: a four-year longitudinal study' in Bynner, J. and Reder, S. (eds) *Tracking adult basic skills: findings from longitudinal research.* New York: Routledge

Modood, T., Berthoud, R., Lakey, J., Nazroo, J., Smith, P., Virdee, S. and Beishon, S. (1997) *Ethnic minorities in Britain: Diversity and disadvantage.* London: Policy Studies Institute

Modood, T. and Shiner, M. (1994) *Ethnic Minorities and Higher Education.* London: Policy Studies Institute

Nandi, A. and Platt, L. (2010) *Ethnic minority women's poverty and economic well being.* London: Government Equalities Office

Newton, B., Meager, N., Bertram, C., Corden, A., George, A., Lalani, M., Metcalf, H., Rolfe, H., Sainsbury, R. and Weston, K. (2012) *Work Programme evaluation: Findings from the first phase of qualitative research on programme delivery.* Department for Work and Pensions Research Report No. 821

ODPM (2006) State of the English Cities, Volume 1. London: Office of the Deputy Prime Minister. Available at: http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20060731065549/http://communities. gov.uk/pub/4/StateoftheEnglishCitiesVolume1PDF33Mb_id1164004.pdf

Ofsted (2013a) *Unseen children: access and achievement 20 years on: Evidence report.* Manchester: Ofsted

Ofsted (2013b) G*oing in the right direction?: Careers guidance in schools from September 2012.* Manchester: Ofsted

Owen, D., Green, A., Pitcher, J. and Maguire, M. (2000) *Minority ethnic participation and achievements in education, training and the labour market.* Department for Education and Employment Research Report No. 225

Platt, L. (2006) *Understanding ethnic group differences in Britain. The role of family background and education in shaping social class outcomes.* London: IPPR. Available at: http://www.ippr.org/ ecomm/files/platt_paper.pdf

Platt, L. (2011) *Inequality within ethnic groups.* JRF programme paper: Poverty and ethnicity. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Rolfe, H. and Anderson, T. (2003) *A firm choice: law firms' preferences in the recruitment of trainee solicitors.* Commissioned by the Law Society

Sales, R., Ryan, L., Rodriguez, M. and D'Angelo, A. (2008) *Polish pupils in London schools: Opportunities and challenges.* Middlesex: Multiverse and Middlesex University

Sammons, P., Sylva, K., Melhuish, E., Siraj-Blatchford, I., Taggart, B. and Elliot, K. (2002) *Measuring the impact of pre-school on children's cognitive progress over the pre-school period.* EPEE Technical Paper 8a. London: Institute of Education

Scottish Government (2012) Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation: Glasgow City, Local Authority Summary – 2012. http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/0041/00410731.pdf

Shaw, A. (2000) *Kinship and Continuity: Pakistani Families in Britain.* London: Routledge/Harwood

Sherbert Research (2009) *Customer Voice Research: Information, Advice and Guidance*. DCSF Research Report. London: DCSF

Skills Funding Agency (2013) *Equality and Diversity data report, 2009/10 to 2011/12*. Coventry: Skills Funding Agency. Available at: http://www.thedataservice.org.uk/NR/rdonlyres/16B30301-216D-44B3-ADAC-4ABF46F50748/0/SFA_Equality_Diversity_datareport200910_1112.pdf

Strand, S. (1999) 'Ethnic group, sex and economic disadvantage: Associations with pupils' educational progress from baseline to the end of Key Stage 1'. *British Educational Research Journal*, 25(2), pp. 179–202

Strand, S. (2011) 'The limits of social class in explaining ethnic gaps in educational attainment'. *British Educational Research Journal*, 37(2), pp. 197–229

Strand, S. (2012) 'The White British-Black Caribbean achievement gap: tests, tiers and teacher expectations'. *British Educational Research Journal*, 38(1), pp. 75–101

Strauß, S. (2008) *Volunteering and social inclusion: Interrelations between unemployment and civic engagement in Germany and Great Britain*. Wiesbaden: VS, VerlagfürSozialwissenschaften

Sullivan, A., Ketende, S. and Joshi, H. (2013) 'Social Class and Inequalities in Early Cognitive Scores'. *Sociology*, April

Sullivan, R. (2010) *Barriers to the legal profession*. London: Legal Studies Board. Available at: https://research.legalservicesboard.org.uk/wp-content/media/2010-Diversity-literature-review.pdf

Tackey, N. D., Barnes, H. and Khambhaita, P. (2011) *Poverty, ethnicity and education*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at: http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/poverty-ethnicity-education-full.pdf

Tunstall, R., Lupton, R., Green, A., Watmough, S. and Bates, K. (2012) *Disadvantaged young people looking for work: A job in itself?* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at: http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/young-people-disadvantage-jobseekers-full.pdf

Vasta, E. (2007) *Accommodating diversity: why current critiques of multiculturalism miss the point*. Centre on Migration, Policy and Society Working Paper No. 53. University of Oxford. Available at: http://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/fileadmin/files/Publications/working_papers/WP_2007/WP0753%20Vasta.pdf

Vignoles, A. (2009) 'The returns to investments in adult skills in the UK, and the effectiveness of policies aimed at improving them'. Paper presented at Education policy in the 21st century, IFS Residential Conference, Cambridge, 3 April 2009

Yates, S., Harris, A., Sabates, R. and Staff, J. (2010) 'Early occupational aspirations and fractured transitions: A study of entry into "NEET" status in the UK'. *Journal of Social Policy*, 40(3), pp. 513–34

APPENDIX 1

Method

Overview

The research was conducted in three areas of the country (Luton, Leicester and Glasgow) and focussed on three ethnic minority groups (African Caribbeans, East African Asians and Pakistanis). Each ethnic group was studied in two case study areas: African Caribbeans and East African Asians in Leicester and Luton, and Pakistanis in Leicester and Glasgow. In each case study area, in-depth interviews were held with local stakeholders, local key informants, individuals from the selected ethnic minority groups and employers and recruitment agencies. In addition, we gathered documentary information on the case study area.

African Caribbeans, East African Asians and Pakistanis were selected for a number of reasons. We wanted to include groups with, on average, differing employment outcomes (East African Asians do relatively well in comparison with Pakistanis and African Caribbeans) and different cultures (which may affect attitudes towards work) and support structures (which may affect access to work).

The areas were selected so that the ethnic minority groups formed different percentages of the population and varied in whether they were the largest ethnic minority group. The latter was because we were interested in exploring whether the concerns of the largest ethnic minority might dominate support. For practical reasons, each area had to have a relatively large percentage of people from the selected ethnic group.

The following provides more detail on the method and describes the participants.

The interviews

The interviews and discussions were conducted using semi-structured discussion guides to explore the following:

- the impact of migration history;
- cultural attitudes to education and employment;
- the local economic context;
- job-search methods and the role of social networks within this process;
- knowledge of and access to information about business support and training;
- personal barriers to employment; and
- reasons for concentration in particular sectors, occupations and types of employment.

Two group interviews were held with stakeholders in each area. The first focussed on the above issues, the second gathered feedback on initial findings and discussed policy responses.

Key informants, individuals and employers were interviewed one-to-one. With individuals, detailed educational and employment histories were taken.

APPENDIX 2

The case study areas

Table 15: Employee jobs by residence, Oct. 2011–Sept. 2012[a]

	Leicester	Luton	Glasgow	Britain
Total jobs				
Full-time	69	70	70	69
Part-time	31	30	31	31
By industry				
Manufacturing	14	13	5	10
Construction	4	3	4	5
Services	82	84	90	84
Distribution, hotels and restaurants	20	20	20	23
Transport and communications	3	13	5	6
Finance, IT, other business activities	20	22	28	22
Public admin., education, health	34	24	31	27
Other services	5	4	6	5
By sector				
Public	26	22	24	22[b]
Private	74	78	76	78[b]

[a] % of population aged over 16
[b] UK.
Source: Annual population survey.

Table 16: Employment by occupation and residence, Oct. 2011–Sept. 2012[a]

	Leicester	Luton	Glasgow	Britain
SOC major group 1–3	**33**	**32**	**44**	**44**
Managers, directors and senior officials	9	5	8	10
Professional occupations	15	17	23	19
Associate professional & technical	9	10	12	14
SOC major group 4–5	**19**	**24**	**18**	**22**
Administrative & secretarial	10	12	9	11
Skilled trades occupations	9	12	9	11
SOC major group 6–7	**19**	**20**	**19**	**17**
Caring, leisure and other service	9	11	10	9
Sales and customer service occupations	10	19	8	8
SOC major group 8–9	**29**	**24**	**19**	**17**
Process plant & machine	11	10	6	6
Elementary occupations	17	14	13	11

[a] % of population aged over 16
Note: % is a proportion of all persons in employment aged 16 and over.
Source: Annual population survey.

Table 17: Children living in poverty, 2012

Leicester %	Luton %	Glasgow %	UK %
29	27	35	20

Campaign to End Child Poverty (2013) Child Poverty Map of the UK: http://www.endchildpoverty.org.uk/images/ecp/130212%20ECP%20local%20report%20final(2).pdf

Table 18: Economic activity, Leicester and Luton, 2011

	Leicester					Luton				
	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/ Caribbean/ Black British: Caribbean %	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/ Caribbean/ Black British: Caribbean %
Economically active[a], of which	**55**	**56**	**58**	**48**	**54**	**59**	**62**	**59**	**50**	**65**
In employment, of which	90	91	91	87	83	91	93	93	85	88
Employee, of which	89	90	89	78	91	85	87	87	72	89
Employee: part-time	29	26	33	36	29	26	24	22	34	25
Self-employed, of which	11	10	11	22	9	15	13	13	28	11
Self-employed: part-time	32	31	32	36	33	29	25	26	40	31
Unemployed	10	9	9	13	17	9	7	7	15	12
Economically inactive[a], of which	**29**	**32**	**29**	**29**	**31**	**29**	**31**	**20**	**34**	**24**
Retired	52	62	43	19	65	55	69	55	17	62
Looking after home or family	20	14	25	48	9	22	12	19	50	11
Long-term sick or disabled	17	17	18	14	17	13	12	14	13	14
Economically inactive: Other	12	8	14	19	9	11	7	12	20	12
Students[a]	**16**	**12**	**13**	**23**	**14**	**12**	**7**	**21**	**16**	**11**
% students working	23	26	24	21	30	28	34	33	19	30
Percentage of population by ethnicity (row percentage)	100	53	28	2	2	100	60	6	12	4

[a] Students, whether economically active or not, are reported separately from the rest of the population. Thus the total population is comprised of the economically active (excluding students), the economically inactive (excluding students) and students.

Source: UK Census 2011, DC6201EW – Economic activity by ethnic group by sex by age.

Table 19: Economic activity, Leicester and Luton, females, 2011

	Leicester					Luton				
	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/Caribbean/Black British: Caribbean %	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/Caribbean/Black British: Caribbean %
Economically active[a], of which	**48**	**50**	**49**	**35**	**49**	**52**	**56**	**55**	**31**	**64**
In employment, of which	90	92	90	83	88	91	94	92	80	91
Employee, of which	94	94	94	91	95	94	94	92	92	95
Employee: part-time	42	40	44	51	40	38	37	34	49	32
Self-employed, of which	6	6	6	9	5	6	6	8	8	5
Self-employed: part-time	50	54	45	58	48	53	55	41	57	47
Unemployed	10	8	10	17	12	9	6	8	20	9
Economically inactive[a], of which	**36**	**37**	**39**	**45**	**33**	**37**	**37**	**27**	**54**	**24**
Retired	48	60	38	14	65	48	66	49	11	61
Looking after home or family	28	20	34	59	12	31	18	27	62	16
Long-term sick or disabled	13	13	15	10	15	10	10	13	9	12
Economically inactive: Other	11	7	13	16	8	11	6	11	18	11
Students[a]	**16**	**13**	**12**	**21**	**17**	**11**	**7**	**18**	**14**	**12**
% students working	24	29	23	16	32	29	37	24	16	35
Percentage of population by ethnicity (row percentage)	100	54	29	2	2	100	61	5	12	5

[a] Students, whether economically active or not, are reported separately from the rest of the population. Thus the total population is comprised of the economically active (excluding students), the economically inactive (excluding students) and students.

Source: UK Census 2011, DC6201EW – Economic activity by ethnic group by sex by age.

Table 20: Economic activity, Leicester and Luton, males, 2011

	Leicester					Luton				
	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/Caribbean/Black British: Caribbean %	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/Caribbean/Black British: Caribbean %
Economically active[a], of which	**63**	**62**	**67**	**61**	**60**	**67**	**68**	**61**	**66**	**67**
In employment, of which	89	90	91	89	79	91	93	93	88	85
Employee, of which	85	85	85	71	87	79	81	84	64	83
Employee: part-time	18	12	24	27	17	15	9	13	26	15
Self-employed, of which	15	15	15	29	13	21	19	16	36	17
Self-employed: part-time	26	23	28	32	27	24	17	20	39	24
Unemployed	11	10	9	11	21	9	7	7	12	15
Economically inactive[a], of which	**22**	**26**	**20**	**14**	**29**	**21**	**25**	**14**	**16**	**23**
Retired	58	64	55	36	65	66	75	66	38	64
Looking after home or family	5	4	6	12	4	4	3	5	10	5
Long-term sick or disabled	23	23	24	26	20	17	15	15	26	18
Economically inactive: Other	13	9	15	26	11	12	7	14	27	13
Students[a]	**16**	**12**	**13**	**25**	**10**	**13**	**7**	**24**	**18**	**10**
% students working	22	23	25	24	26	28	29	38	21	24
Percentage of population by ethnicity (row percentage)	100	53	28	2	2	100	60	6	12	4

[a] Students, whether economically active or not, are reported separately from the rest of the population. Thus the total population is comprised of the economically active (excluding students), the economically inactive (excluding students) and students.

Source: UK Census 2011, DC6201EW – Economic activity by ethnic group by sex by age.

Table 21: Socio-economic group, Leicester and Luton, 2011

Socio-economic group	Leicester					Luton				
	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/Caribbean/Black British: Caribbean %	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/Caribbean/Black British: Caribbean %
1. Higher managerial, administrative and professional	6	6	6	7	4	6	6	11	4	6
1.1 Large employers and higher managerial and administrative	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	0	2
1.2 Higher professional	5	5	5	6	3	5	5	10	4	4
2. Lower managerial, administrative and professional	13	15	10	10	17	16	18	15	8	20
3. Intermediate	10	11	11	9	12	12	15	10	7	14
4. Small employers and own account workers	6	6	6	9	5	9	9	6	13	6
5. Lower supervisory and technical	6	8	5	3	6	7	9	5	4	7
6. Semi-routine	16	16	17	11	17	15	16	14	12	18
7. Routine	17	18	18	9	15	13	16	10	10	12
8. Never worked and long-term unemployed	11	8	14	19	11	10	5	8	26	7
L14.1 Never worked	9	5	12	17	7	8	4	6	24	3
L14.2 Long-term unemployed	2	2	2	3	4	2	2	2	2	4
L15 Full-time students	15	12	12	22	14	12	7	21	16	11
All categories: NS-SeC, row percentage	100	53	28	2	2	100	60	6	12	4

Source: UK Census 2011, DDC6206EW – NS-SeC by ethnic group by sex by age.

Table 22: Socio-economic group, Leicester and Luton, females, 2011

Socio-economic group	Leicester					Luton				
	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/Caribbean/Black British: Caribbean %	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/Caribbean/Black British: Caribbean %
1. Higher managerial, administrative and professional	4	5	4	4	3	4	4	8	3	5
1.1 Large employers and higher managerial and administrative	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	2
1.2 Higher professional	3	4	3	3	2	3	3	7	2	3
2. Lower managerial, administrative and professional	14	16	10	10	20	17	19	16	8	25
3. Intermediate	14	16	13	11	16	18	22	15	10	19
4. Small employers and own account workers	3	3	3	3	2	3	4	4	2	3
5. Lower supervisory and technical	4	5	3	2	3	4	5	3	1	4
6. Semi-routine	16	18	15	10	16	17	19	15	10	20
7. Routine	16	16	20	9	12	11	14	10	7	8
8. Never worked and long-term unemployed	14	8	21	32	10	14	7	13	45	6
L14.1 Never worked	12	6	19	29	7	13	5	11	43	3
L14.2 Long-term unemployed	2	2	2	3	3	2	2	2	2	3
L15 Full-time students	15	13	11	20	17	11	6	17	14	12
All categories: NS-SeC, row percentage	100	54	78	7	51	100	61	5	12	5

Source: UK Census 2011, DDC6206EW – NS-SeC by ethnic group by sex by age.

Table 23: Socio-economic group, Leicester and Luton, males, 2011

Socio-economic group	Leicester					Luton				
	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/ Caribbean/ Black British: Caribbean %	All %	White %	Asian/Asian British: Indian %	Asian/Asian British: Pakistani %	Black/African/ Caribbean/ Black British: Caribbean %
1. Higher managerial, administrative and professional	8	8	8	10	5	8	9	14	6	7
1.1 Large employers and higher managerial and administrative	1	2	1	1	1	2	2	2	1	1
1.2 Higher professional	7	7	7	9	4	7	7	13	5	6
2. Lower managerial, administrative and professional	12	14	11	11	12	14	16	14	9	14
3. Intermediate	7	6	9	7	6	6	7	6	4	9
4. Small employers and own account workers	9	10	10	16	8	14	14	8	22	10
5. Lower supervisory and technical	9	10	7	5	9	11	13	7	6	10
6. Semi-routine	15	13	19	11	18	12	12	13	15	15
7. Routine	18	20	17	10	19	15	18	10	12	17
8. Never worked and long-term unemployed	7	7	7	7	12	6	4	4	9	8
L14.1 Never worked	5	4	5	5	7	3	2	3	5	4
L14.2 Long-term unemployed	3	3	2	2	6	2	2	1	3	5
L15 Full-time students	15	12	13	24	10	13	7	24	18	10
All categories: NS-SeC, row percentage	100	52	28	2	2	100	58	6	12	4

Source: UK Census 2011, DDC6206EW – NS-SeC by ethnic group by sex by age.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Andrew Corley was a Research Assistant at the National Institute of Economic and Social Research. His research interests are youth unemployment, education, training and skills.

Anitha George is a Research Fellow at the National Institute of Economic and Social Research. Her research focusses on labour market transitions and disadvantage.

Mumtaz Lalani was a Research Fellow at the National Institute of Economic and Social Research. Her research focusses on two areas: disadvantage and discrimination in the labour market and migration.

Hilary Metcalf is Director of Employment and Social Policy Research at the National Institute of Economic and Social Research. Her research focusses on disadvantage in the labour market and policies for addressing disadvantage.

Heather Rolfe is a Principal Research Fellow at the National Institute of Economic and Social Research. Her research interests are migration and disadvantage, and discrimination in employment and education.

Leila Tufekci is a Research Officer at the National Institute of Economic and Social Research. Her research focusses on labour market disadvantage and welfare.

JRF

JOSEPH
ROWNTREE
FOUNDATION

INSPIRING
SOCIAL
CHANGE